




Andrzej Kompa (Łódź)

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7284-6820>

GNESIOI FILOI: GEORGE SYNCELLUS AND THEOPHANES THE CONFESSOR – ADDENDA

Abstract. The paper provides the addenda to A. Kompa, *Gnesioi filoi: the search for George Syncellus' and Theophanes the Confessor's own words, and the authorship of their oeuvre*, *Studia Ceranea* 5, 2015, p. 155–230. All the expressions crucial to the stylistic and stylometric argument on the authorship of the *Chronography* of Theophanes have been updated after 7 years and verified in the expanded TLG database. The updated results are presented below. The conclusions confirm the previous opinions on the individual, singular authorship of the chronicle of Theophanes with differences in style from the first part of the universal history, written by George Syncellus. At the same time, both works should be treated as a single project, and the prooimion to Theophanes' part as a sound base for the reconstruction of the writing process. The clauses *ὡς προέφην, καθὼς καὶ προέφην, ὡς προέφημεν, and καθὼς προέφημεν* are specific to the *Chronography* of Theophanes in their frequency and diversity, but they seem to be known and used by the circles from which Theophanes acquired his literary skills.

Keywords: Theophanes the Confessor, George Syncellus, Georgios Synkellos, Byzantine chronography, Byzantine historiography, *Chronographia*, *Ekloge chronographias*, *gnesios philos*, TLG, world chronicles, *hos proephen, kathos kai proephen, hos proephemien, hos ephen, hos ephemen*, *ὡς προέφην, καθὼς καὶ προέφην, ὡς προέφημεν, καθὼς προέφημεν, ὡς ἔφη, ὡς ἔφημεν*, stylometry

In 2015 I published a paper in the 5th volume of “*Studia Ceranea*”, devoted to the much disputed authorship of the *Chronography* or *Chronicle* of Theophanes the Confessor¹. My intention was to stress the unique bond that links that

¹ A. KOMPA, *Gnesioi filoi: the search for George Syncellus' and Theophanes the Confessor's own words, and the authorship of their oeuvre*, *SCer* 5, 2015, p. 155–230. A much shorter version of that paper was published a few months earlier: A. KOMPA, *In search of Syncellus' and Theophanes' own words, and the authorship of the Chronographia revisited*, *TM* 19, 2015 (= *Studies in Theophanes*, ed. M. JANKOWIAK, F. MONTINARO, Paris 2015), p. 73–92.

The bibliography pertaining to the matter of the chronicle and its authorship is to be found in the *SCer* paper, p. 155–156, n. 1 & 2. Below is the updated list, covering the studies published in the recent years: S. ALBRECHT, *Theophanes Confessor*, [in:] *Encyclopedia of medieval chronicle*, ed. G. DUNPHY, vol. 2, *J–Z*, Leiden–Boston 2010, p. 1421–1422; W. TREADGOLD, *The middle Byzantine historians*, New York 2013, p. 38–77; P. VARONA, *Three clergymen against Nikephoros I: remarks on*

work with the *Ekloge chronographias* by George Syncellus and to highlight the differences in language and style of the two parts at the same time. While preparing the Polish version of that text for the forthcoming book, I repeated the stylometric analysis in its entirety after 7 years, taking advantage of the largely expanded *The-saurus Linguae Graecae* (TLG). The results confirmed and strengthened my argument. To avoid inconsistencies between the English and the Polish version, I present the updated material below. The tables were used to reveal the phrases based on forms of the verb πρόφημι as the most significant indicator of the authorship of the *Chronography* in Theophanes' part.

It should be stressed that the 22 updates of the TLG between September 2015 and September 2022 have supplemented the database with plethora of important sources of various genres, covering much of that part of the Byzantine literary heritage which was missing before. Ca. 1700 works by nearly 450 authors, both known by name and anonymous, have been digitalised altogether within last seven years². Many *vitae* and works by the ecclesiastical writers that I had to survey independently before 2015 have now been included³. As for significant Byzantine examples, one may mention e.g.: Justin the Martyr (2 works added to the base), John Chrysostom (8 works), Synesius of Cyrene (9), Hesychius of Jerusalem (11), Leontius of Byzantium (10), Maximus the Confessor (18), George Pisides (7), Andrew of Crete (5), the patriarch German I (5), Theodore the Studite (13), the patriarch

Theophanes' Chronicle (AM 6295–6303), B 84, 2014, p. 485–509; F. MONTINARO, *Histories of Byzantium: some remarks on the early manuscripts of Theophanes' Chronicle*, SClA 8, 2015, p. 171–176; R.M. PARRINELLO, *Teofane il Confessore, ovvero la storia letta da un punto di vista cristiano*, RSCr 12, 2015, p. 83–95; K. MARINOW, *Pan Kubrat i jego pięciu synów. Teofanesa wizja przybycia Bułgarów na Półwysep Bałkański*, BP 23, 2016, 15–34; L. NEVILLE, *Guide to Byzantine historical writing*, Cambridge 2018, p. 61–71; A. SIROTENKO, *Constructing memory: the Chronicle of Theophanes on the reign of Heraclius*, [in:] *Storytelling in Byzantium: narratological approaches to Byzantine texts and images*, ed. C. MESSÉS, M. MULLETT, I. NILSSON, Uppsala 2018, p. 223–242; P.A. YANNOPOULOS, *Un fantôme historique: l'autre Theophane*, BZ 113, 2020, p. 189–217; O. PRIETO DOMÍNGUEZ, *Literary circles in Byzantine iconoclasm: Patron, politics and saints*, Cambridge 2021, p. 53–59; D. БРОДКА, *Rebellen und Usurpatoren – zur Benutzung der Theodor-Lector-Epitome durch Theophanes*, [in:] *Studies in Theodore Anagnostes*, ed. R. KOSIŃSKI, A. SZOPA, Turnhout 2021, p. 183–203; J.W. TORGERSOHN, M. HUMPHREYS, *Chronicles, histories and letters*, [in:] *A companion to Byzantine iconoclasm*, ed. M. HUMPHREYS, Leiden–Boston 2021, p. 195–199, 203–208; J.W. TORGERSOHN, *The Chronographia of George the Syncellus and Theophanes: the ends of time in ninth-century Constantinople*, Leiden–Boston 2022.

² The list of updates is to be found at <http://stephanus.tlg.uci.edu/news.php> as well as at http://stephanus.tlg.uci.edu/tlgauthors/post_tlg_e.php. The simple addition of the numbers specified in the 'News' reveals 1002 authors (yet partially the same in the subsequent supplements) as well as 1755 works, but a thorough counting of the lists yields 400–600 writers and 1703 texts. Nevertheless, it should be borne in mind that anonymous works, especially hagiographic, could in some cases be penned by the same authors.

³ Cf. A. KOMPA, *Gnesioi filoi*, p. 167–168, n. 15.

Nicephorus I (6), Michael Psellus (i.a. the epistulae), Nicetas David Paphlagon (9), Symeon Metaphrastes (as many as 109 added lives, passions and martyria), John Zonaras (6), John Tzetzes (10), Neophytus the Recluse (7), Constantine Manasses (10), Eustathius of Thessalonica (5), Theodore Prodromus (7), Manuel Gabalas (6 new to the previous 2), Maximus Planudes (6), Theodore Metochites (7), Nicholas Cabasilas (15), Nicephorus Callistes Xanthopoulos (7), Thomas Magister (13), Demetrius Cydones (9), Manuel Chrysoloras (5), Manuel Calecas (5), Manuel II (4), Bessarion (4) and many other. Several authors, previously unavailable in TLG, have been at least partially added, i.a. Isaac of Nineveh, Severianus of Gabala (mostly the *spuria*), Joseph the Melodist, Alexius Aristenus, Euthymius Zigabenus, Matthew Cantacuzenus, Cyrillus Lucares, Christopher Zonaras, Matthew Blastares, Anthony Eparchus, Mercurius the Grammarian, Meletius Pigas or Theodore Kolokotronis. Besides hagiography, the acts of the councils and synods, as well as many menologia, canonaria, apocrypha and encomia have been added to the base.

The methods of collecting the data and all necessary caveats are the same as in the original paper, and thus I refrain from repeating them here. As for the updated tables, Table II presents all the instances of *ὡς προέφην / καθὼς καὶ προέφην / ὡς προέφημεν (-αμεν) / καθὼς προέφημεν (-αμεν)* and similar phrases since their first apparition in Greek in the 1st c. BC to the late 16th c. AD. Table III summarizes the usage of the much more common phrases *ὡς (καθὼς) ἔφη, ὡς (καθὼς) ἔφη(α)μεν* including *ὥσπερ ἔφη / ἔφη(α)μεν*. Table IV juxtaposes the most significant cases of those displayed in the two former ones. To make the diversity of usage more noticeable, some of the authors who used the shorter forms but never applied the phrases with *πρόφημι*, have also been included. The results have been carefully recounted and some minor errors eliminated. The chronological order has been maintained and the most significant cases bolded or underlined.

Table II [SCer 5, 2015, p. 168–176]

Ὦς προέφην / καθὼς καὶ προέφην / ὡς προέφημεν (-αμεν) / καθὼς προέφημεν (-αμεν) and similar phrases in ancient and medieval Greek:	
Philodemus of Gadara	1 pl <i>Peri poiēmatōn</i> , V, 33, [in:] <i>Philodemos über die Gedichte, fünftes Buch</i> , ed. C. JENSEN, Berlin 1923 (ὡς προέφημεν)
Arius Didymus	1 s <i>Liber de philosophorum sectis (epitome ap. Stobaeum)</i> , [in:] <i>Fragmenta Philosophorum Graecorum</i> , rec. F.W.A. MULLACH, vol. II, Parisiis 1867, p. 97, 6–7r (ὡς προέφην)
Ps.-Aristotle*	1 pl <i>De plantis</i> , II, [in:] ARISTOTELE, <i>Le piante</i> , ed. M.F. FERRINI, Milano 2012, p. 825a (ὡς προέφημεν)
Nicomachus	1 pl <i>Introductio arithmetica</i> , rec. R. HOCHÉ, Leipzig 1866, II, 25, 2 (ὡς προέφημεν)
<i>Corp. Hermeticum</i>	+1 pl <i>Harmonicum enchiridion</i> , 12, [in:] <i>Musici scriptores graeci</i> , rec. K. VON JAN, Leipzig 1895, p. 262, 11–12 (περὶ οὗ καὶ προέφημεν)
Justin Martyr	1 pl fr. 26, 25; ed. A.-J. FESTUGIÈRE, A.D. NOCK, vol. III, Paris 1954 (ὡς προέφημεν)
	13 s <i>Apologia secunda</i> , 8(3), 6, [in:] <i>Apologie pour les chrétiens</i> , ed. Ch. MUNIER, Paris 2006 [= SC, 507] (ὡς προέφην)
	<i>Dialogus cum Tryphone</i> , 19, 2; 21, 1; 41, 2; 51, 2; 53, 4; 56, 10; 63, 2; 88, 8; 92, 3; 92, 6; 94, 2; 102, 2; ed. Ph. BOUCHON, Fribourg 2003 (ὡς προέφην ἐν πολλοῖς)
	+1 s <i>ibidem</i> , 113, 1 (ὡς προέφην γάρ)
	+1 s <i>ibidem</i> , 130, 3 (<ὡς> προέφην)
	+1 s <i>ibidem</i> , 134, 2 (ὡς προέφην ἐν πολλοῖς)
	+1 s <i>ibidem</i> , 138, 2 (<ὡς> προέφην)
	16 pl <i>Apologia</i> , 12, 5; 21, 6; 22, 2; 32, 11; 45, 6; 54, 5; 54, 7; 56, 2; 58, 1; 63, 4; 67, 5 ed. ut supra (ὡς προέφημεν)
	<i>Apologia secunda</i> , 3, 3; 5(6), 5; 7(8), 1; 9, 1
	<i>Dialogus cum Tryphone</i> , 83, 4
Galen	1 s <i>De compositione medicamentorum per genera</i> , I, 17, [in:] <i>Claudii Galeni opera omnia</i> , rec. C.G. KÜHN, vol. XIII, Lipsiae 1827, p. 442 (ὡς προέφην ἔμπροσθεν)

Irenaeus of Lyons	3 pl	<i>Adversus haereses</i> , I, 1, 5 (= MASSUET & SC 264, ed. A. RUSSEAU, L. DOUTRELEAU, Paris 1979, I, 3, 1); I, 3 (= I, 10, 2); V, 17, 4 (cf. ed. L. DOUTRELEAU, B.C. MERCIER, A. ROUSSEAU, Paris 1969 [= SC, 153]: V, I. cit. and fr. gr. 16), ed. W. WIGAN HARVEY, Cambridge 1857, vol. I-II	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
	+3 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , I, 4 (= I, 10, 3); I, 12 (= I, 19, 1); III, 19, 6 (= III, 18, 7; cf. ed. L. DOUTRELEAU, A. ROUSSEAU, Paris 1974 [= SC, 211], I. cit. + fr. gr. 26)	(καθὼς προσέφημεν)
	[+1 pl]	<i>ibidem</i> , V, 24, 3 [and fr. gr. 17], ed. ut supra [= SC, 153]	(ὡς προσέφημεν)]
<i>Clementina</i>	1 s	<i>Die Pseudoklementinen II. Rekognitionen</i> , IX, 25, ed. F. PASCHKE, B. REHM, Berlin 1965	(ὡς προσέφημ)
<i>Hist. Alexandri (ε)</i>	2 s	<i>Anonymi Byzantini vita Alexandri regis Macedoniae</i> , 34, 2; 40, 2, ed. J. TRUMPF, Stuttgart 1974	(ὡς προσέφημ)
	1 pl	<i>Recensio byzantina poetica</i> , [in:] <i>Das byzantinische Alexandergedicht nach dem codex Marcianus 408</i> , ed. S. REICHMANN, p. 645, 7	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Basil of Caesarea	1 s	<i>Constitutiones asceticae</i> [sp.], I, 3, [in:] PG 31, col. 1332	(καθὼς προσέφημ)
Ps.-Ephrem of Chers.	3 pl	<i>De miraculo Clementis Romani</i> , 6; 15; 18, [in:] PG 2, col. 637; 641; 645	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Gregory of Nyssa	1 s	<i>Ad Ablabium quod non sint tres dei</i> , [in:] <i>Gregorii Nysseni opera</i> , vol. III.1, ed. F. MUELLER, Leiden 1958, p. 38, 19	(καθὰ προσέφημ)
	+1 s	<i>Contra Eunomium</i> , 27, 396, ed. W. JAEGER, trans. R. WINLING, Paris 2010 [= SC, 524]	(καθὼς προσέφημ)
	1 pl	<i>Adversus Arium et Sabellium de patre et filio</i> , [in:] <i>Gregorii Nysseni Opera</i> , vol. III.1, ed. F. MUELLER, Leiden 1958, p. 79, 18	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , p. 73, 28	(ὡσπερ προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , p. 84, 2	(καθάρτερ προσέφημεν)
Evagrius Ponticus	1 pl	<i>De oratione (sub nomine Nili Ancyrami)</i> , [in:] PG 79, col. 1184	(καθὼς προσέφημεν)
Ps.-Athanasius	1 pl	<i>Die pseudoathanasianische IVte Rede gegen die Arianer</i> , 19, 6, ed. A. STEGMANN, Rottenburg 1917	(ὡς προσέφημεν)

Table II (cont.)

John Chrysostom	2 s	<i>Fragmenta in Jeremiam (in catenis)</i> , 45, [in:] <i>PG</i> 64, col. 1017	(ὡς προσέφηγν)
		<i>In psalmum 118</i> , I, 1, [in:] <i>PG</i> 55, col. 676	
John Chrysostom, sp.	1 pl	<i>Visio Danielis</i> , [in:] <i>Anecdota Graeco-Byzantina</i> , rec. A. VASSILIEV, pars I, Mosquae 1893, p. 35, 9	(ὡς γὰρ πρεπόντως προσέφηγε(ν))
Ps.-Macarius	2 pl	<i>Sermones (collectio B)</i> , hom. 2, 3, 7; hom. 59, 2, 5, [in:] <i>Makarios/Symeon Reden und Briefe</i> , ed. H. BERTHOLD, vol. I–II, Berlin 1973	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , hom. 40, 1, 10	(ὡς γὰρ προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>Homiliae spirituales</i> , XXI, 4, 46, [in:] <i>Die 50 geistl. Homilien des Makarios</i> , ed. H. DÖRRIES, E. KLOSTERMANN, M. KROEGER, Berlin 1964	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>Peri hypomonḗs kai diakriseōs logos</i> , 27, [in:] <i>PG</i> 34, col. 888	(ὡςπτερ προσέφημεν)
John Stobaeus	1 s	<i>Ioannis Stobaei anthologium</i> , II, 7, 22, rec. C. WACHSMUTH, vol. II, Berolini 1884, p. 143	(ὡς προσέφηγν)
	1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , I, 49, 69, vol. I, p. 471	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Palladius	1 s	<i>Palladii Dialogus de vita S. Ioannis Chrysostomi</i> , XX, 615, ed. A.-M. MALINGREY, Ph. LECLERQ, Paris 1988 [= SC, 341]	(ὡς προσέφηγν)
Philostorgius	1 s	<i>Kirchengeschichte</i> , III, 2a (= <i>Artemii passio</i> , 17), ed. J. BIDEZ, F. WINKELMANN, Berlin 1981	(ὡς προσέφηγν)
	1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , VII, 8a (p. 86 in notes)	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Polychronius of Apamea	1 s	<i>Commentarii in Danielelem (fragm. in catenis)</i> , IX, 25, ed. E. MUTSOULAS, Athena 2007	(καθὼς προσέφηγν)
Eutyches	1 s	letter to the emperor, read during the council of Chalcedon, 834, [in:] <i>ACO</i> , II, 1, 1, ed. E. SCHWARTZ, <i>Berolini-Lipsiae</i> 1933, p. 177, 36	(ὡς προσέφηγν)
<i>Vita Alexandri</i>	1 pl	53, ed. E. DE STOOP, Turnhout 1911 [= <i>PO</i> , 6] (repr. 1981), p. 700, 17	(ὅπτερ προσέφημεν)
Diadochus of Photice	1 s	<i>Sermo de ascensione</i> , [in:] <i>Diadoque de Photice. Oeuvres spirituelles</i> , ed. É. DES PLACES, Paris 1955 [= SC, 5bis], p. 167, 4	(ὡς προσέφηγν)

Gennadius I	1 s	<i>Fragmenta in Epistulam ad Romanos (in ceteris)</i> , [in:] <i>Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen</i> , vol. XV, <i>Pauluskommentare aus der griechischen Kirche</i> , ed. K. STAAB, Münster 1933, p. 369, 11 – repeated in <i>catenae (Catena in epistulam ad Romanos (typ Vat.) (e cod. Oxon. Bodl. Auct. E.2.20 [= Misc. 48])</i> , ed. J.A. GRAMER, vol. I, Oxford 1840, p. 80)	(καθὼς ἦδη προέφην)
	1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , p. 384, 29 (repeated in <i>catenae</i> as above, p. 152)	(ὡς προέφραμεν)
Proclus	1 s	<i>Tomus ad Armenios</i> , 9, [in:] ACO, IV.2, ed. E. SCHWARTZ, Berolini–Lipsiae 1914, p. 189, 5	(καθὰ προέφην)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , 21, p. 192, 13	(καθὰ προέφρημεν)
anon. papyr. mag.	1 s	16, [in:] <i>Papyri Graecae magicae. Die griechischen Zauberpapyri</i> , vol. II, ed. K. PREISENDANZ, A. HENRICHS, ² Stuttgartiae 1974, p. 225	(ὡς προέφην)
Ps.-Gelasius	1 s	<i>Anonyme Kirchengeschichte (Gelasius Cyzicenus, CPG 6034)</i> , III, 13, 8, ed. G.Ch. HANSEN, Berlin–New York 2002 (in editor's view <i>Zusatz des Compilers zum Text seiner Vorlage</i>)	(ὡς ἦδη προέφην)
Ps.-Caesarius	2 s	<i>Die Erotapokriseis</i> , 108, 108; 179, 5, ed. R. RIEDINGER, Berlin 1989	(ὡς προέφην)
	+1 s	<i>ibidem</i> , 121, 9	(καὶ ἄ ἦδη προέφην)
	+1 s	<i>ibidem</i> , 146, 72	(καθὼς προέφην)
John the Lydian	4 pl	<i>De magistratibus populi Romani</i> , II, 13, 4; II, 24, 3; II, 29, 3; III, 53, 2, ed. J. SCHAMP, vol. II, Paris 2006	(ὡς προέφραμεν)
John Scholasticus	2 pl	<i>Prologus et scholia in Dionysii Areopagitiae librum De divinis nominibus</i> , 4, 2305b; 11, 2396b, ed. B.R. SUCHLA, Berlin 2011	(ὡς προέφρημεν)
	+1 s	<i>ibidem</i> , proem. 216c	(καθὰ προέφην)
	+3 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , 1, 2193b; 5, 2317c; 5, 2324a	(καθὰ προέφρημεν)
<i>Vita Irenae</i>	+1 s	19, [in:] A. WURTH, <i>Danae in christlichen Legenden</i> , Wien 1892 [= BHG, 953]	(καθὼς προέφην)
<i>Mart. Dion. Areopag.</i>	1 pl	<i>Martyrium beati Dionysii Areopagitae</i> , [in:] PG 4, col. 680	(ὡς προέφρημεν)

Table II (cont.)

Abraham of Ephesus	1 pl	<i>Homilia de annuntiatione</i> , [in:] <i>Homélieles mariales byzantines</i> , ed. M. JUGIE, Turnhout 1922, p. 446 [= PO, 16]	(μῆδ' ὡς προσέφημεν)
Fl. Phoebammon	1 s	<i>Testamentum Flavii Phoebammonis</i> [Nov. 15, 570], http://webu2.upmf-grenoble.fr/Haiti/Cours/Ak/Negotia/Cair32_DDBDF.gr.html	(ὡς προσέφην)
<i>Chronicon paschale</i>	1 s	rec. L. DINDORE, Bonnae 1832, p. 435, 4	(ὡς οὖν προσέφην)
John Climacus	1 pl	<i>Scala paradisi</i> , 8, 10, [in:] PG 88, col. 832	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Maximus Confessor	2 s	<i>Quaestiones ad Thalassium</i> , proem., 303; 65; 809, ed. C. LAGA, C. STEEL, vol. I–II, Turnhout 1980–1990 [= CC, SG, 7 & 22]	(ὡς προσέφην)
	+1 s	<i>ibidem</i> , 63, 377	(καθὼς προσέφην)
	+1 s	<i>ibidem</i> , 50, 205	(Προέφην γάρ...)
John Presbyter	1 pl	<i>Adversus haereticos</i> , 11, ed. M. RICHARD, REB 28, 1970	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
<i>Vita Alypii Stylitae</i> ₁	1 pl	<i>Vita prior</i> , 4, [in:] H. DELEHAVE, <i>Les saints stylites</i> , Bruxelles–Paris 1923, p. 150, 11	(οἷς καὶ προσέφημεν)
<i>Vita Eustathii et al.</i>	1 s	2, [in:] F. HALKIN, <i>La Passion inédite des Saints Eustathe, Thespésius et Anatole</i> , AB 93, 1975	(καθὼς προσέφην)
Pamphilus of Jerusalem	1 pl	<i>Encomium sancti Soteridis</i> , [in:] <i>Diversorum postchalcadonensium auctorium collectanea I</i> , ed. J.H. DECLERCK, P. ALLEN, Turnhout 1989 [= CC.SG, 19], p. 292, 32	(ὡν ὡς προσέφημεν)
Isaac of Nineveh	1 s	<i>Oratio ascetica XXXII</i> , 23, [in:] <i>Logoi askētikoi 26–41</i> , ed. P.K. CHRESTOU, Thessalonikē 1991	(καθὼς προσέφην)
Leontius of Rome	2 pl	<i>Vita et miracula Sancti Gregorii Agrigeniti / Das Leben des heiligen Gregorius von Agrigent</i> , 39; 85, ed. A. BERGER, Berlin 1995	(ὡς καὶ προσέφημεν)
Tarasius I	1 s	words noted in 787 below the letter of Germanus I to Constantine of Nacoleia (ep. 3, 44), [in:] PG 98, col. 164 and ACO II.3, <i>Concilium universale Nicaenum secundum</i> , ed. E. LAMBERZ, pars II, Berlin–Boston 2012	(ὡς καὶ προσέφην)
		Ταράσιος ὁ ἀγιώτατος πατριάρχης εἶπεν· ὡς καὶ προσέφην, τίμοι ἀδελφοί, ἡ εἰσαγωγή τῆς ἐπεισάκτου καινοτομίας ταύτης γέγονεν ἐκ τοῦ προειρημένου ἀνδρὸς ἐπισκόπου Νακωλείας. Κωνσταντῖνος ὁ θεοφιλέστατος διάκονος καὶ νοτάριος ἀνέγνω.	

acta of Nicaea II	1 pl	ACO II.3, ed. E. LAMBERZ, pars I, Berlin–Boston 2008, p. 84 (οἱ εὐλαβέστατοι μοναχοὶ εἶπον.)	(ἰδοὺ καθὼς προσέφημεν)
nov. of Irene	1 pl	nov. 27, [in:] L. BURGMANN, <i>Die Novellen von Kaiserin Eirene</i> , in <i>Fontes Minores IV</i> , ed. D. SIMON, Frankfurt am Main 1981, p. 20, 62	(οἷων προσέφημεν)
George Syncellus	0		
Theophanes	6 s 5 pl		
nov. of Leo/Constantine*	2 pl	nov. 26, 26, 4 & 10, [in:] D. SIMON, <i>Zur Ehegesetzgebung der Isaurier</i> , in <i>Fontes Minores I</i> , ed. IDĒM, Frankfurt am Main 1976, p. 25, 84; 28, 174–175	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
	+ 1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , p. 24, 55 (cf. two additional: p. 25, 95–96; 26, 125–126 in fragment absent from some of Mss.)	(ὡς προσέφημεν...)
George Choeroboscus	1 pl	<i>Prologomena et scholia in Theodosii Alexandrini canones</i> , [in:] <i>Grammatici Graeci</i> , ed. A. HILGARD, vol. IV.2, Lipsiae 1894, p. 38 cf. <i>Epimerismi Homericī</i> , 52f	(ὡς προσέφημεν) (καθὼς προσέφημεν)
Michael Syncellus	1 pl + 1 pl	<i>Peri tes tou logou syntaxeos</i> , 56, [in:] <i>Le traité de la construction de la phrase de Michel le Syncelle</i> , ed. D. DONNET, Bruxelles 1982 <i>ibidem</i> , 115	(καθ' ἄτερ προσέφημεν) (καθὰ προσέφημεν)
Ps.-John of Damascus	1 pl	<i>Quaestiones et responsiones</i> , v. 632–633, [in:] <i>Die Erotapokriseis des Pseudo-Johannes Damaskenos zum Kirchengesang</i> , ed. C. HANNICK, G. WOLFRAM, Wien 1997	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Vita Const. et Helenae	1 pl	65, [in:] H.G. OPITZ, <i>Die vita Constantini des codex Angelicus</i> 22, B 9.2, 1934	(καθὼς προσέφημεν)
Vita Nicephori med.	1 pl	9, 1, [in:] F. HALKIN, <i>La Vie de s. Nicéphore, fondateur de Médikion en Bithynie (d. 813)</i> , AB 78, 1960, p. 412	(ὡς ἀνωτέρω προσέφημεν)
Methodius I	1 pl	<i>Vita Euthymii Sardiani</i> , 15, 301, ed. J. GOULLARD, TM 10, 1987: (ὁ ἀδελφὸς καὶ συναρχιερεὺς τοῦ Ἰαλυρικοῦ...)	(...ὄν προσέφημεν)
Sophronius of Alex.	1 pl	<i>Excerpta ex Joannis Characi commentariis in Theodosii Alexandrini canones</i> , [in:] <i>Grammatici Graeci</i> , vol. IV.2, ed. A. HILGARD, Leipzig 1894, p. 392, 6	(...ὄν προσέφημεν)

Table II (cont.)

<i>Vita Andreae in crisi</i>	1 s	<i>Martyrium sancti et gloriosis... Andreae</i> , 5, [in:] <i>Acta Sanctorum Octobris</i> , vol. VIII, (Oct. 27–30), Parisiis–Roma 1866, p. 137	(ὡς προσέφην)
Sabbas	1 s	<i>Vita Ioannicii</i> , 6, 22(c), [in:] <i>Acta Sanctorum Novembris</i> , vol. II.1, (Nov. 3–4), Bruxellis 1894, p. 353	(ὡς προσέφην)
Sabbas	1 s	<i>Vita Petri Atroatae / La Vie merveilleuse de saint Pierre d'Atroa</i> , 67, ed. V. LAURENT, Bruxelles 1956	(ὡς προσέφην)
<i>Vita Athanasiae</i>	1 pl	L. CARRAS, <i>The Life of St Athanasia of Aegina: A Critical Edition with Introduction</i> , 21, 38, [in:] <i>Maistor. Classical, Byzantine nad Renaissance Studies for Robert Browning</i> , ed. A. MOFFATT, Canberra 1984	(ὡς προσέφην)
George the Monk	1 pl	<i>Chronicon</i> , X, rec. C. DE BOOR, vol. II, Studgardiae 1904, p. 416, 20	(καθὼς προσέφην)
?Paul of Nicaea	1 s	<i>Manuale medico</i> , 92, 19, ed. A.M. IERACI BTO, Napoli 1996	(ὡς προσέφην)
Photius I	1 pl	<i>Bibliotheca</i> , cod. 192a, p. 154b–155a; ed. R. HENRY, vol. III, Paris 1962	(Ἄλλ' ὃ και προσέφην)
	+1 pl	<i>Contra Manichaeos / Récit de la réapparition des manichéens</i> , 54, ed. W. WOLSKA-CONUS, TM 4, 1970, p. 139, 13–14	(ὡς και προσέφην)
	+1 pl	<i>Fragmenta in epistulam II ad Corinthios (in catenis)</i> , [in:] <i>Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen</i> , vol. XV, <i>Pauli-skomentare aus der griechischen Kirche</i> , ed. K. STAAB, Münster 1933, p. 587, 16	(καθὼς και προσέφην)
Procopius	1 pl	words of the bishop of Caesarea (Capp.), in the acts of Constantinople IV (session 879/880), ed. K. SIAMAKES, Thessalonikē 1985	(ὡς προσέφην)
Nicetas the Teacher	1 pl	<i>Refutatio et eversio epistulae ab Armeniae principe missae</i> , 18, [in:] PG 105, col. 648c	(ὡς προσέφην)
Leo VI the Wise	1 s	v. 134, F. CICCIOLELLA, <i>Il carme anacreontico di Leone VI</i> , BC 10, 1989, p. 23	(ὡς προσέφην)
Arethas of Caesarea	1 pl	<i>Commentarius in Apocalypsin</i> , 7, [in:] PG 106, col. 548	(ὡς προσέφην)
Nicholas Mysticus	1 s	ep. 2, 29, [in:] <i>Nicholas I, Patriarch of Constantinople, Letters</i> , ed. R.J.H. JENKINS, L.G. WESTERINK, Washington 1973	(τοῦτο δὴ ὃ προσέφην)

	+1 pl	ep. 2, 14	(ὁ προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	ep. 6, 74	(ὡς οὖν προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	ep. 135, 21–22	(...ὡς προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	ep. 101a, 10	(ἐν οἷς προσέφημεν)
Basil	1 pl	<i>Vita Euthymii iunioris</i> , 36, ed. L. PETT, ROC 8, 1903, p. 202, 8	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Constantine VII	2 pl	<i>De administrando imperio</i> , 29, 84–85, ed. G. MORAVCSIK, R.J.H. JENKINS, ² Washington 1967	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
		<i>De cerimonis aulae Byzantinae</i> , I, 10, ed. A. VOGT, vol. I, Paris 1935, p. 71, 6–7	
<i>Martyrium Irenaei</i>	1 s	<i>Martyrion tou hagiou Eirēnaiou episkopou Sirmiou</i> , 26, 5, [in:] V. LATYSEV, <i>Menologii Byzantini saeculi X quae supersunt</i> , fasc. 1, <i>Februarium et Martium menses continens... e Codice Mosquensi 376 Vlad.</i> , Leipzig 1970	(ὡς προσέφημν)
Lucas Adialeptus	1 s	<i>Exhortatio ad virgines</i> , 11, [in:] A. RIGO, <i>Un autore spirituale sconosciuto del X secolo: Luca Adialeptos</i> , B 79, 2009	(ὡς προσέφημν)
Ps.-Heron	1 pl	<i>Geodaisia</i> , 9, 47, [in:] D.F. SULLIVAN, <i>Siegecraft: Two Tenth-Century Instructional Manuals by "Heron of Byzantium"</i> , Washington 2000	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Nicephorus	2 pl	<i>Vita sancti Andreae Sali</i> , 21; 36, ed. L. RYDÉN, Uppsala 1995	(ὡς προσέφημν)
<i>Vita Pauli iun.</i>	1 pl	37, ed. H. DELEHAYE, [in:] <i>Milet. Ergebnisse der Ausgrabungen und Untersuchungen</i> , ed. Th. WIEGAND, vol. III.1, Berlin 1913, p. 127	(ἦ προσέφημεν)
<i>De velitatione bell.</i>	1 pl	4, 4, [in:] <i>Le traité sur la guérilla (De velitatione) de l'empereur Nicéphore Phocas</i> , ed. G. DAGRON, H. MIHAESCU, Paris 1986, p. 45	(καθάρτερ προσέφημεν)
<i>Digenis Acrifas</i>	1 s	IV, 583, ed. E. JEFFREYS, Cambridge 1998, p. 100	(καθώσπερ καὶ προσέφημν σοὶ)

Table II (cont.)

John of Sicily	1 s	<i>Commentarius in Hermogenis librum Peri ideon</i> , IV, 47, [in:] <i>Rhetores Graeci</i> , vol. VI, rec. C. WALZ, Stuttgartae et al. 1834, p. 184, 29–30	(ὡς προέφρην)
	+1 s	<i>ibidem</i> , IV, 42, p. 181, 10	(ὡσπερ προέφρην)
acta of Oppido	1 s	doc. nr 10 (sign. Nicholas Cataspites), [in:] A. GUILLOU, <i>La Théotokos de Hagia-Agathe (Oppido, 1050–1064/65)</i> , Città del Vaticano 1972	(ὡς προέφρην)
	+1 s	doc. nr 38 (sign. Andrew Mutzekises), [in:] <i>ibidem</i>	(ὡς προέφρην)
Michael I Cerularius, sp.	1 pl	<i>Panoplia</i> , IIIa, c. 19, [in:] A. MICHEL, <i>Humbert und Kerullarios: Quellen und Studien zum Schisma des XI Jht.</i> , Paderborn 1930, p. 234	(καθὼς προέφρημεν ἀνωθεν)
acta of Cellarana	2 pl	doc. nr 2, v. 22 i 28, [in:] A. GUILLOU, <i>Saint-Nicodème de Cellarana (1023/1024–1232)</i> , Città del Vaticano 1968	(ὡς προέφρημεν)
Philip Solitarius	1 s	<i>Dioptra</i> , 2, 1, ed. S. LABRIOTES, <i>Ho Athos</i> , vol. I, Athenai 1920	(ὡς προέφρην)
	+2 s	<i>ibidem</i> , 4, 7; 4, 8	(ὡς ἦδη σοι προέφρην)
	1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , 4, 7	(ὡς προέφρημεν πολλάκις ἐν...)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , 1, 5	(καθὼς σοι καὶ προέφρημεν ἀνωθεν ἐν...)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , 2, 12	(καθὰ δὴ καὶ προέφρημεν πρό μικροῦ ἐν...)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , 3, 2	(καθὼς πέρ σοι προέφρημεν ἐν...)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , 4, 3	(καθὼσπερ καὶ προέφρημεν πολλάκις ἐν...)
Michael Attaleiates	2 pl	<i>Historia</i> , ed. I. BEKKER, Bonn 1853, p. 84, 8; 99, 2–3	(ὡς προέφραμεν)
	+1 pl	<i>Ponema nomikon etoi synopsis pragmatike</i> , 4, 3, [in:] <i>Ius graecoromanum</i> , ed. J. ZEPHOS, P. ZEPHOS, Athenae 1931	(οἷς προέφραμεν)

- Vita Cosmae & Joannis* 1 pl? *Vita Cosmae Melodi et Joannis Damasceni*, 15 [in:] *Analekta Ierosolymitikes stachylogias*, ed. A. ΡΑΡΑΔΟΡΟΥ-ΛΟΣ-ΚΕΡΑΜΕΥΣ, vol. IV, Petroupolei 1897, p. 283, 2–3 (ὡς προσέφημεν)
- Vita Niconis* 2 pl 12; 57; ed. D. SULLIVAN, Brookline Mass. 1987 (ὡς ἔφθημεν ειπόντες)
- Christodulus** 4 pl *Testamentum et codicillus Christoduli (a. 1093)*, in test.: p. 82, [28], p. 82, [31], p. 83, [20]; in cod.: p. 89, [12]; ex *Acta monasterii Patmi*, [in:] *Acta et Diplomata Graeca Medii Aevi sacra et profana*, ed. F. ΜΙΚΛΟΣΤΙΧ, J. ΜÜLLER, vol. VI, Vindobonae 1890 (ὡς προσέφημεν)
- Vita Phantini iun.* 1 s *La vita di san Fantino il Giovane*, 32, 2, ed. E. FOLLIERI, Bruxelles 1993 (καὶ ἦν προσέφην)
- Translatio Nicolai* 1 pl 20, [in:] *Der Heilige Nikolaos in der griechischen Kirche. Texte und Untersuchungen*, ed. G. ANRICH, vol. I, Leipzig–Berlin 1913 (ὡς προσέφημεν)
- Theodore of Andida 1 pl *Brevis commentatio de divinae liturgiae mysteriis*, 10, [in:] PG 140, col. 429 (τούτου γὰρ ἔνεκεν ἐν προομίοις προσέφημεν)
- Euthymius Zigabenus** 1 pl *Commentarius in psalterium*, ps. 30, 23, [in:] PG 128, col. 357 (ὡς προσέφημεν)
- +3 pl *ibidem*, ps. 30, 10, col. 352; ps. 40, 14, col. 468; ps. 80, 16, col. 849 (ὡς ἐν τῷ ... ψαλμῷ προσέφημεν)
- +1 pl *ibidem*, ps. 65, 7, col. 652 (δὲ ἄς προσέφημεν)
- 5 pl *Commentaria in quattuor evangelia*, Mt praef.; Mt 2, 13; Mt 12, 5; Mt 24, 14; J 10, 31, [in:] PG 129, col. 116; 149; 365; 608; 1336 (ὡς προσέφημεν)
- +1 pl *ibidem*, Mt 19, 8, col. 517 (προσέφημεν ... ἐν τῷ δηλωθέντι ... κεφαλαίῳ)
- John Tzetzes** 2 s *Exegesis in Homeri Iliadem*, v. 226, sch. 41; v. 459, sch. 3, [in:] *Der unbekannte Teil der Ilias-Exegesis des Ioannes Tzetzes (A 97–609)*, ed. A.C. LOLOS, Königstein 1981 (προσέφην)
- +1 s *ibidem*, v. 357, sch. 29 (ὄσα προσέφην)
- +1 s *Chiliades*, II, 48, 710, [in:] *Ioannis Tzetzae Historiae*, ed. P.L.M. LEONE, Napoli 1968 (ὡς ἦδη σοι προσέφην)
- 1 pl *Exegesis in Homeri Iliadem*, v. 423, sch. 81 (ὡς καὶ προσέφημεν)

Table II (cont.)

	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , v. 413, sch. 66	(δι' ἄπτερ προέφημεν)
	+1 pl	ep. 28, 9–10, rec. P.A.M. LEONE, Leipzig 1972, p. 44	([ὥσπερ προέφημεν])
	+1 pl	<i>Scholia in Aristophanem</i> , 990b, [in:] <i>Joannis Tzetzae Commentarii in Aristophanem</i> , ed. W.J. W. KOSTER, Groningen 1962	(οὐσπερ προέφημεν)
Eustathius of Thess.	1 pl	<i>Commentarii ad Homeri Illiadem</i> , ed. M. VAN DER VALK, vol. I, Leiden 1971, p. 265	(ὡς καὶ προέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>Exegesis in canonem iambicum pentecostalem</i> , I, 121, ed. P. CESARETTI, S. RONGHEX, Göttingen 2014	(ὡς προέφημεν)
acta of Theristes	1 s	doc. nr 30 (of Constantine ho tou Filore), <i>Corpus des actes grecs d'Italie du Sud et de Sicile</i> , vol. V, <i>Saint-Jean-Theristes (1054–1264)</i> , ed. C. GIANNELLI et al., Citta del Vaticano 1980	(ὡς προέφημν)
	+1 s	doc. nr 21 (of Rogerius Muschatus), [in:] <i>ibidem</i>	(ὡς καὶ προέφημν)
	4 pl	doc. nr 19 (of Arcadius, son of Isidore & oth.); nr 22 (of Leo son of Puva, with 2 sons); nr 29 (of Adilica with son John); nr 33 (of Scribonissa), [in:] <i>ibidem</i>	(ὡς προέφημεν)
Neophytus the Recluse	6 s	<i>Deka logoi peri tou Christou entolon</i> , hom. 4, 17, ed. I.E. STEPHANES, [in:] <i>Hagiou Neophytou tou Egkleistou Syggrammata</i> , ed. I. KARABIDROPOULOS, C. OIKONOMOU, D.G. TSAMES, N. ZACHAROPOULOS, vol. I, Paphos 1996	(ὡς προέφημν)
		<i>Testamentum sive Typike dialheke</i> , 24, ed. I.E. STEPHANES, [in:] <i>ibidem</i> , vol. II, Paphos 1998	
		<i>Biblos ton katecheseon</i> , ed. P. SOTIROUDIS, I, cat. 6, [in:] <i>ibidem</i> , vol. II	
		<i>Panegyrike A'</i> , 8, 207; 21, 438, ed. Th. GIAGKOU, N. PAPATRIANTAFYLLOU-THEODORIDI, [in:] <i>ibidem</i> , vol. III, Paphos 1999	
		<i>Hermēneia kanonōn tōn dōdeka despotikōn Heortōn</i> , ot. VI, 29, ed. A. SAKELLARIDOU-SOTIROUDI, [in:] <i>ibidem</i> , vol. V, Paphos 2005	
	+1 s	<i>Liber quinquaginta capitulorum</i> , 39, 13, ed. P. SOTIROUDIS, [in:] <i>ibidem</i> , vol. I	(προέφημν σοι ὄντι')
	10 pl	<i>Deka logoi peri tou Christou entolon</i> , hom. 4, 4; hom. 4, 12	(ὡς προέφημεν)

Biblos ton katecheseon, II, 37; II, 49

Panegyrike A', 8, 346; 19, 415; 26, 33

To asma asmaton, 3, 113–114, ed. B.S. PSEUTOGKAS, [in:] *ibidem*, vol. II

Hermēneia kanonōn tōn dōdeka despotikōn Heortōn, or. III, 22, [in:] *ibidem*, vol. V

Logos eis to Hagion Pneuma kai eis tēn Hagian Pentēkostēn, II, 182, ed. B.K. KATSAROS, [in:] *ibidem*, vol. V

+1 pl *Panegyrike A'*, 29, 265–266

(καθ' ὃν προέφημεν τρόπον)

+1 pl ep. 5, v. 40, ed. A. KARPOZELOS, [in:] *ibidem*, vol. V

(Διὰ ταῦτα γὰρ καὶ τὰ
τοιαῦτα προέφημεν ὅτι
γίνεται τῆς ἡσυχίας ἡ ἀρχὴ
περιστασιοῦ ἀφορμῆ.)
(καθὼς καὶ προέφημεν)

+1 pl ep. 7, v. 70, [in:] *ibidem*, vol. V

Nicholas of Otranto

1 s *Disputatio contra Iudaeos*, [in:] *Nektariou, hegoumenou mones Kasoulou, Nikolaou, hegoumenou mones Hydrountinou Dialexis kata Ioudaion*, ed. M. CHRONZ, Athens 2009, p. 77, 14

(ὡς προέφηγν)

+1 s *ibidem*, p. 114, 3

(...σοὶ καὶ προέφηγν ὅτι...)

+1 s *ibidem*, p. 125, 8

(ὡς καὶ προέφηγν)

6 pl *ibidem*, p. 20, 19; 86, 6; 128, 10; 180, 3; 210, 20; 227, 12

(ὡς προέφημεν)

+4 pl *ibidem*, p. 18, 21; 80, 20; 113, 17; 223, 1

(ὡς καὶ προέφημεν)

Acacius Sabaites

1 pl *Commentarius in Andrae Cretensis canonem*, 6, 171, [in:] A. GIANNOULI, *Die beiden byzantinischen Kommentare zum Grossen Kanon des Andreas von Kreta: Eine quellenkritische und literarhistorische Studie*, Wien 2007

(καλῶς οὖν προέφημεν)

Manuel Holobolus

1 s *Oratio 2 in imp. Michaelēm Palaeologum*, [in:] *Manuelis Holoboli orationes*, ed. M. TREU, pars 2, Potsdam 1907, p. 87, 2

(ὡς προέφηγν)

Andrew Libadenus

1 s *Descriptio itineris*, [in:] *Andreu Libadenou bios kai erga*, vol. I, ed. O. LAMPSTDES, Athenais 1975, p. 40, 14

(ὡς προέφηγν)

Table II (cont.)

George Acropolites	1 s	<i>Laudatio Petri et Pauli</i> , 16, [in:] <i>Georgii Acropolitae opera</i> , vol. II, rec. A. HEISENBERG, Studgardiae 1978, p. 96, 34	(εί γάρ καί προσέφην)
	1 pl	<i>Annales</i> , 80, [in:] <i>ibidem</i> , vol. I, p. 165, 14	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Const. Meliteniotes	2 s	<i>Orationes antirrhethicae adversus tomum Gregorii II Cyprii</i> , ed. M. ORPHANOS, Athēna 1986, p. 187, 277	(ὡς προσέφην)
Maximus Planudes	1 pl	<i>Macrobium Commentariorum in Somnium Scipionis</i> , II, 10, 10, ed. A. MEGAS, Thessaloniki 1995	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Apparitio Michaelis	1 pl	A. LAGIOIΣ, <i>Una versione greca inedita della Apparitio sancti Michaelis in monte Gargano (BHG 1288h, Messan. gr. 29)</i> , VChr 51, 2014, p. 194, 8–9	(ὁ προσέφημεν)
George Metochites	1 s	<i>Historia dogmatica</i> , I, 5, [in:] <i>Nova Patrum Bibliotheca</i> , rec. J. Cozza, vol. VIII.2, Roma 1871, p. 6	(ὡς προσέφην)
	2 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , I, 96, p. 133; III, 9, [in:] <i>NPB</i> , rec. J. Cozza-Luzzi, vol. X.1, Roma 1905	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Theodore Metochites	1 pl	<i>Byzantios vel Laus Constantinopolitana</i> , 48, ed. J. POLEMIS, Thessalonike 2013	(ὁς προσέφημεν)
John XIII Glycas	1 s	<i>Opus de vera syntaxeos ratione</i> , ed. A. ЈАНН, Bern 1839, p. 26, 18	(ὡς ἀρχόμενος προσέφην)
	1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , p. 34, 4–5	(ὡς ἀνωθεν προσέφημεν)
<i>Actum Isaaci profi</i>	1 pl	(a. 1316), [in:] <i>Actes d'Esphigménou</i> , ed. J. LEFORT, Paris 1973, p. 91, 80–81 = <i>Diploma Isaaci profi de cambitate agrorum</i> (a. 1316), 80–81, [in:] <i>Actes de Vatopédi I, Des origines à 1329</i> , ed. J. BOMPAIRE, C. GIROS, V. KRAVARI, J. LEFORT, Paris 2001, p. 271	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Gregory Palamas	1 s	<i>Contra Nicephorum Gregoram</i> , or. II, 67, [in:] <i>Grēgoriou tou Palama syggammata</i> , ed. P.K. CHRESTOU, vol. IV, Thessalonike 1988	(καθότιερ καί προσέφην)
	1 pl	<i>De processione Spiritus Sancti</i> , or. II, 78, 11, [in:] <i>ibidem</i> , vol. I, Thessalonike 1962	(καθὰ προσέφημεν)
Gregory Acindynus	1 pl	<i>Antirrhethicus maior</i> , IV, 6, 35, [in:] <i>Gregorii Acindyni Refutationes duae</i> ... ed. J. NADAL CAÑELLAS, Turnhout 1995 [= CC.SG, 31]	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
David Dishypatus	3 pl	<i>Logos kata Barlaam kai Akindynou pros Nikolaon Kabasilan</i> , p. 53, 1; 64, 2; 74, 17; ed. D.G. TSAMES, Thessalonike 1976	(ὡς προσέφημεν)

<i>Prochiron Auctum</i>	1 pl	XXVII, 284, rec. P. ZEPOS (post C.E. ZACHARIÁ VON LINGENTHAL), Athenae 1931 (repetition of the nov. of Irene, cf. above)	(οίων προέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , XXXI, 39 (citation from Attaliateis' <i>Ponema nomikon</i> , cf. above)	(οίς προέφημεν)
<i>Prochiron Calabriae</i>	1 pl	XXIII, 46, [in:] <i>Prochiron Legum</i> , ed. F. BRANDILEONE, V. PUNTONI, Roma 1895	(οίους προέφημεν)
<i>Exegesis in Hesiodi</i>	1 pl	ad 270, <i>Glossen und Scholien zur hesiodischen Theogonie</i> , ed. H. FLACH, Leipzig 1876, p. 389, 9	(ώς προέφημεν)
<i>Schol. coll. Marc.</i>	1 pl	<i>Peri prosodion</i> , [in:] <i>Scholía [Commentaria] in Dionysii Thracis Artis grammaticam</i> , rec. A. HILGARD, Lipsiae 1901, p. 293, 11	(ώς προέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>Peri technes</i> , [in:] <i>ibidem</i> , p. 298, 17	(καθὰ προέφημεν)
Thomas Magister	2 pl	<i>Thomae Magistri sive Theoduli monachi Ecloga vocum Atticarum</i> , ed. F. RITTSCHL, Halis Saxonum 1832, p. 352, 14–15 & 371, 6	(ώς προέφημεν)
Nicephorus Gregoras	1 s	<i>Explicatio in librum Synesii De insomniis</i> , 138c, 157, 16, ed. P. PIETROSANTI, Bari 1999	(ώς προέφη)
	1 pl	<i>Liber dogmaticus V</i> , 15 (<i>Historiae byzantinae libri postremi</i> , XXXIV, 56), rec. I. BEKKER (<i>Nic. Greg.</i> vol. III), Bonnae 1855, p. 469, 17–18	(ώς άνωτέρω προέφημεν)
Theophanes of Perithorion	1 pl	20, [in:] F. HALKIN, E. KOURILAS, <i>Deux Vies de S. Maxime le Kausokalybe ermite au Mont Athos</i> (XIV s.), AB 54, 1936, p. 92, 34	(ώς προέφημεν)
Philotheus Coccinus	1 s	<i>Laudatio Sancti Demetrii</i> , 17, 13, [in:] <i>Philotheou K-poleos tou Kokkinou hagiologika erga</i> , vol. II, ed. D.G. TSAMES, Thessalonike 1985	(ώς προέφη)
John Cyparissiotis, sp.	1 pl	<i>Adversus Cantacuzenum</i> , [in:] <i>Theologica varia inedita saeculi XIV</i> , ed. J. POLEMIS, Turnhout 2012, p. 266, 35	(καθώς προέφημεν)
Isidore Glabas	1 pl	<i>Homilia XXIII</i> , 1, [in:] <i>Isidōrou Glaba archiepiskopou Thessalonikēs Homilies</i> , ed. V. CHRISTOPHORIDES, vol. I, Thessalonikē 1996	(ώς που κατ τούτο προέφημεν)
Theodore Meliteniotes	5 pl	<i>De astronomia libri III</i> , I, 3, 14; I, 18, 7; II, 4, 38–39; II, 5, 317; II, 8, 9, ed. R. LEURQUIN, vol. I, Amsterdam 1990; vol. II, Amsterdam 1993	(ώς προέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , II, 22, 103	(ώς προέφημεν)

Table II (cont.)

Callistus Angelicudes	1 pl	<i>Refutatio Thomae Aquinae</i> , 396, ed. S.G. ΠΑΠΑΔΟΠΟΥΛΟΣ, Athens 1970	(ώς προσέφημεν)
	+1 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , 186	(Προσέφημεν γάρ...)
<i>Vita Romyli/Romuli</i>	1 pl	7, [in:] F. HALKIN, <i>Un ermite des Balkans au XIV^e siècle. La vie grecque inédite de Saint Romylos</i> , B 31, 1961	(ώς άνωτέρω προσέφημεν)
editor of Pachymeres	1 pl	<i>Historia brevis</i> , VI, 24, [in:] <i>Le version brève des Relations Historiques de Georges Pachymérés</i> , ed. A. FAILLER, vol. I, Paris 2001	(ώς προσέφημεν)
Symeon of Thess.	2 s	<i>Apologia de habitu ad Constantinopolim</i> , 5, 24–25, [in:] <i>Politico-Historical Works of Symeon Archbishop of Thessalonica (1416/17 to 1429)</i> , ed. D. BALFOUR, Wien 1979, p. 72	(ώς προσέφημν)
	ep. 5, 357,	[in:] <i>Hagiou Symeon Thessalonikes 1416/1417–1429, erga theologika</i> , ed. D. BALFOUR, Thessalonike 1981	
	2 pl	ep. 2, 571; 6, 220	(ώς προσέφημεν)
<i>Tract. arithmeticus</i>	1 pl	<i>Tractatus arithmeticus, e cod. Vat. Barb. gr. 4</i> , [in:] M.D. CHALKOU, <i>The Mathematical Content of the Codex Vindobonensis Phil. Graecus 65 (ff. 11–126)</i> , Thessalonike 2006, p. 17 (fragm. Περὶ τοῦ θεμελίου αὐτῶν)	(ώς προσέφημεν)
Manuel II	1 s	<i>Dialogi cum mahometano</i> , 8, [in:] <i>Manuel II. Palaiologos. Dialoge mit einem "Perser"</i> , ed. E. TRAPP, Wien 1966, p. 100, 30	(ώς δὴ προσέφημν)
John Cananus	1 pl	<i>De Constantinopoli oppugnata</i> , v. 53, / <i>L'assedio di Costantinopoli</i> , ed. E. PINTO, Messina 1977	(ώς προσέφημεν)
Gennadius II	1 pl	<i>Epitome primae partis Summae theologiae Thomae Aquinae</i> , III, 44, [in:] <i>Oeuvres complètes de Georges (Gennadios) Scholarios</i> , ed. M. JUGIE, L. PETIT, X.A. SIDERIDES, vol. V, Paris 1931	(ὡς ιδέας προσέφημεν)
Ducas	2 pl	<i>Historia Turco-Byzantina</i> , 22, 11; 44, 3, [in:] ed. V. GRECU, București 1958	(καθὼς προσέφημεν)
<i>Actum Bessarionis</i>	1 pl	(a. 1500), 25, [in:] <i>Actes d'Iviron</i> , vol. IV, <i>De 1328 au début du XV^e siècle</i> , ed. J. LEFORT et al., Paris 1995, p. 180	(ὄν ἄνωθεν προσέφημεν)
<i>Actum Joachim I</i>	1 pl	(a. 1501), 23, [in:] <i>Actes de Kullumus</i> , ed. P. LEMERLE, Paris 1988, p. 163	(ώς προσέφημεν)

<i>Ekthesis chronica</i>	1 pl	48, 1, [in:] <i>Emperors, Patriarchs and Sultans of Constantinople, 1373–1513. An Anonymous Greek Chronicle of the Sixteenth Century</i> , ed. M. PHILIPPIDES, Brookline Mass. 1990	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
Macarius Melissenus	1 s	<i>Chronicon sive maius</i> , IV, 13, [in:] GEORGIOS SPHRANTZES, <i>Memorii, 1401–1477</i> , ed. V. GRECU, București 1966, p. 524, 18–19	(ὡς προσέφην ἐν τοῖς πρώοην βιβλίοις)
	2 pl	<i>ibidem</i> , I, 5; I, 11; ed. ut supra, p. 172, 5; 188, 21	(ὡς προσέφημεν)
anon., undated	1 pl	<i>Actum falsum Isaaci et concilii Caryanum</i> , 24, [in:] <i>Actes de Docheiariou</i> , ed. N. ΟΙΚΟΝΟΜΙΔΗΣ, Paris 1984, p. 336 (cf. <i>ibidem</i> , 17)	(ὡς προσέφημ[ε]ν)

in total **105 s**

216 pl (including 24 with προσέφημεν)

* Ascribed to Nicholas of Damascus.

** It is not clear who are the Emperors Leo and Constantine, and the exact date of the law is unknown – some scholars suggested Leo III (726/727 – e.g. D. Simon), Leo IV (776/780 – e.g. K. E. Zachariä von Lingenthal); at the same time, one of the Mss. speaks of the 7th year of reign explicite, what cannot be agreed with too short a reign of Leo IV, and to the issue of co-emperorship), Leo V (819/820 – e.g. O. Kresten, and later S. Troianos), or Leo VI (911/912 – e.g. A. Schminck, with the 7th year counted for Constantine VII; but why co-emperor Alexander would be omitted then?); all the datation proposals are gathered and discussed by A. SCHMINCK, *Zur Datierung der eherechtlichen Novelle der Kaiser Leon und Konstantinos*, ΕΚΕΙΕΔ 46, 2016, p. 179–189 and S. TROIANOS, *Die Quellen des Byzantinischen Rechts*, trans. D. SIMON, S. NEYE, Berlin–Boston 2017, p. 110, note 14. A. Schminck's argumentation is worth discussing, and I am personally inclined to date the law to the reign of Leo V and Constantine (Smbat), thus its chronological place in the table, yet not without hesitations. Discussion on proper attribution is yet far from its end.

* * *

Some of the passages from Irenaeus were repeated in catenae (f.ex. *Catena in epistolam Petri I / catena Andraeae*, [in:] *Catena Graecorum patrum in Novum Testamentum*, vol. VIII, rec. J. A. CRAMER, Oxford 1840, p. 56, 9 – the same is cited also by Euthymius Zigabenus in his commentary to the 1 Peter, 2, 17, [in:] *Euthymii Zigabeni Commentarius in XIV epistolas Sancti Pauli et VII catholicas*, ed. N. CALOGERAS, vol. II, Athenis 1887), by Epiphanius of Salamis in his *Panarion* (ed. K. HOLL, vol. I, Leipzig 1915, p. 406, 432, 434; vol. II, Leipzig 1922, p. 32) and by Theodoret of Cyrhus (*Eranistes*, ed. G. H. ETTINGER, Oxford 1975, p. 153). There may have been 4 other plural instances of ὡς/καθὼς προσέφημεν in *Adversus haereses* of Irenaeus – the relevant parts survived, alas, only in a Latin translation (III, 12, 9; IV, 12, 1; IV, 34, 2; IV, 58, 5, ed. W. WIGAN HARVEY, vol. II, Cambridge 1857). In one of the sources cited by Epiphanius in *Panarion* the forms ὡς προσέφημεν and ὡς προσέφημεν occur divided by a few verses only (Epiphanius, *Ancoratus und Panarion*, ed. K. HOLL, vol. III, Leipzig 1933, p. 270, 17 and 20).

Table II (cont.)

John of Damascus used the above-listed forms only twice, citing Philostorgius' *Historia ecclesiastica* in his *Passio magni martyris Artemii* – once in the singular (17, ὡς προέφην), and once in the plural form (51, ὡς προέφημεν) – ed. P.B. KOTTER, vol. V, Berlin–New York 1988 (cf. P. ΒΑΤΤΙΟΛ, RQ 3, 1889, p. 268, 274 – in this oldest reconstructed ὡς προέφην is omitted on p. 268). It is interesting that no other source witness of Philostorgius' *HE* shows any quotations in fragments from which it was reconstructed; moreover, the above-mentioned two instances, differing in number, do not occur in any other work by John. One may well presume here the activity of a copyist or an editor of *Passio Artemii*. George Cedrenus used ὡς προέφην (rec. I. BEKKER, vol. I, Bonnæ 1838, p. 604, 6), but in a quotation from Theophanes (AM 5943, p. 105, 3–4) and καθὼς προέφημεν (p. 409, 2) in a quotation from George the Monk (*ut supra*).

* * *

Cf. Themistius, *In Aristotelis physica paraphrasis*, rec. H. SCHENKL, Berlin 1900, p. 140, 18–20; *Catena in Matthaeum* (*e cod. Paris. Coislin. gr. 23*), [in:] *Catena...*, vol. I, rec. J.A. CRAMER, Oxford 1840, p. 171 with καθὼς προέφην omitted in one of the MS (*ibidem*, p. 489, 16) || John Chrysostom, *In Matthaeum*, hom. 68, [in:] PG 58, col. 634, 4–7; *idem*, *Expositiones in Psalmos*, [in:] PG 55, col. 190, 25; Theoctistus the Studite, *Canones in Athanasium*, II, 5, 3, 8, ed. E. AFENTOULIDOU-LEITGEB, Vienna 2008; Theodoret of Cyrillus, *Commentaria in Isaiam*, 8, 185, ed. J.-N. GUINOT; Theodore the Studite, poem 7 (ed. J.B. PITRA, Paris 1876); Symeon the New Theologian, hymn 30, 283 (ed. A. KAMBYLIS, Berlin–New York 1976); Eustathius of Thessalonica, *Commentarii ad Homeri Iliadem* (ed. M. VAN DER VALK, vol. I, Leiden 1971, p. 633, 6), *Comm. ad Homeri Odysseam* (rec. G. STALLBAUM, vol. II, Lipsiae 1826, p. 253, 36), *Oratio 4*, 174 (ed. S. SCHÖNAUER, Frankfurt am Main 2006); Theodore Agallianus, *Sermones duo apologetici*, 261; 1213, [in:] Ch.G. PATRINELES, *O Theodoros Agallianos...*, Athenai 1966; John Mauroplus, 4, 9, *Canones in s. Nicolaum*, [in:] A.D. PANAGIOTOU, *Ho Iōannēs Mauroplus hymnografos tou Hagiou Nikolaou*, Athēna 2008; *idem*, *Canones paraclitici*, I, 1, [in:] *Giovanni Mauropodē, metropolita di Eucalia. Otto canoni paraclitici*, ed. E. FOLLIERI, Roma 1967; Bessarion, *In calumniam Platonis*, I, 5, 2 (καὶ οὐκ ἄνωτέριον προέφημεν); IV, 2, 6 (ἂ γὰρ ἡμεῖς διὰ βραχέων προέφημεν); ed. L. MOHLER, vol. II, Paderborn 1927 and Bessarion's *Egkōnion eis Trapezounta* (*e cod. Venet. Marc. 533*), ed. S.P. LAMPROS, Athēna 2000, p. 120, 6 (ὁὐ τὸν πύργον ἐπ' αὐτῇ δεδομησθαι τῇ εἰσοδῷ προέφημεν).

A few isolated instances have been omitted, e.g. 1 pl *Scholia recentiora in Aeschylum*, v. 225, [in:] *Aeschyli tragoediae superstites...*, ed. W. DINDORF, Oxford 1851; 1 pl *Scholia in Aeschyli Persas*, 228, ed. O. DÄHNHARDT, Lipsiae 1894; 1 pl *Commentarium in librum Peri heurseos*, [in:] WALZ, *Rhet. gr.*, vol. VII, p. 839; 1 pl *Anonymous questions and answers on the interval signs*, VII, 298, ed. B. SCHARTAU, Vienna 1998, or *Epimerismi Homericī, pars prior*, 52f, ed. A.R. DΥCK, Berlin 1983.

Pages are added in the bibliographical notes mainly if there is no other more precise identification of the *loci*, if the division of the source does not provide a quick reference to the passage, or if the identification in TLG is imprecise. Conventional Latin names of the works were used in the table in order to make TLG verification easier.

(the last update 30 October 2022, with 2857 authors included in TLG, the original version was of 18 October 2015, with 2420 authors then included in TLG)

Table III. [SCer 5, 2015, p. 180–183]

(a / b)	(ὥς ἔφην & καθὼς ἔφην / ὥς ἔφη(α)μεν & καθὼς ἔφη(α)μεν)
(a+b / c+d)	(ὥς ἔφην & καθὼς ἔφην + ὥσπερ ἔφην / ὥς ἔφη(α)μεν & καθὼς ἔφη(α)μεν + ὥσπερ ἔφη(α)μεν)
~ 5 th –1 st BC	
<p>Empedocles of Acragas (1 / 0), Antiphron (0 / 1), Hippocrates + corpus (3 / 0), Plato (0 / 8), Aristotle + corpus (1 / 5+3), Diocles (4 / 0), Asclepiades (1 / 1), Heraclides Ponticus (1 / 0), Theophrastus (2 / 1), Euclid (0 / 2), Philochorus of Athens (0 / 1), Erasistratus (1 / 0), Archimedes (0 / 1), Chrysippus (8 / 0), Aristophanes of Byzantium (0 / 0+1), Attalus of Rhodes (1 / 0), Hipparchus of Nicaea (1 / 1), Agatharchides of Cnidus (0 / 1), Artemidorus (1 / 0), Posidonius of Apamea (2+1 / 0+2), <i>Peri homoion kai diaphoron lexeon</i> (1 / 0), <u>Philodemus of Gadara</u> (3 / 1), Nicholas of Damascus (1 / 0), Diodorus Siculus (0 / 0+1), Dionysius of Halicarnassus (<u>2+45 / 2</u>), Strabo (<u>8+1 / 3+3</u>), Anubion (0+1 / 0)</p>	
total: (42+48 / 28+10) 90 s / 38 pl	
~ 1 st –3 rd AD	
<p>Philo of Alexandria (<u>44+4 / 0</u>), Heraclitus the Allegorist (0+2 / 0), Demetrius the Rhetor (1 / 0), Rufus of Ephesus (0 / 2), Aelius Theon (0 / 2), <u>Nicomachus of Gerasa</u> (1 / 1), Cornutus (1 / 0), <i>Vita Adam et Evae</i> (1 / 0), Soranus (2 / 0), Flavius Joseph (<u>13+2 / 7</u>), Theon of Smyrna (0 / 3), Plutarch of Chaeronea (5+3 / 0), Gaius Suetonius (0 / 1), Dio Chrysostom (8 / 0), Aspasius (1 / 4+2), Aelius Aristides (8+12 / 0), Archigenes (0 / 1), <u>Justin the Martyr</u> (2 / 1), Ps.-Justin (2+1 / 0), Phlegon of Tralles (0 / 0+1), Rufus of Perinthus (0 / 0+1), Claudius Ptolemy (<u>3 / 60</u>), Albinus of Smyrna (0 / 1), Antigonus of Nicaea (1 / 0), Athenagoras of Athens (1 / 0), <i>Epistula ad Diognetum</i> (1 / 0), <i>Epistulae Themistoclis</i> (0+2 / 0), Hierocles (2 / 0), Achilles Tatius (5 / 0), Oenomaus (1 / 0), Papias (1 / 0), Apollonius Dyscolus (<u>3 / 36</u>), <i>Phalaridis epistulae</i> (1 / 0), Theophilus of Antioch (0 / 4), Timaeus the Sophist (0 / 1), Lucian (12+6 / 0), <u>Irenaeus of Lyons</u> (0 / 1), <u>Galen</u> (<u>ok. 370+10 / 15</u>), Ps.-Galen (7+2 / 3), Aelius Herodianus (0+1 / 3), Marcus Aurelius (1 / 0), Hermogenes of Tarsus (9+4 / 6), Clement of Alexandria (1+1 / 3), Ps.-Longinus (9 / 0), Athenaeus (4 / 0), Cassius Dio (4 / 2), Origen (2 / 2), Alexander of Aphrodisias (<u>12 / 23</u>), Sextus Empiricus (14 / 1), Philostratus (7 / 0), Heliodorus (1 / 0), Gaius the Roman (1 / 0), Porphyrius of Tyre (2 / 9+1), Gregory the Wonderworker (2 / 0), <u>Clementina</u> (25 / 2), <i>Corpus Hermeticum</i> (3 / 0), Aristides Quintilianus (7 / 0), <i>Martyrium Carpi, Papyli et Agathonicae</i> (1 / 0), Hippolytus of Rome (12 / 0), Herodianus (2 / 0), Eutecnus (0+1 / 1), Dionysius Cassius Longinus (1 / 0), Diophantus (0 / 1), Plotinus (0 / 1), Methodius of Olympus (16 / 0), Cassius the Iatrosophist (0 / 10)</p>	
total: (633+51 / 207+5) 684 s / 212 pl	
4 th –6 th AD	
<p>Ulpian of Antioch (2 / 0), Menander the Rhetor (1+1 / 4+1), Jamblichus (0 / 4), Sopater (4 / 4), Eustathius of Antioch (2 / 0), Julian the Arian (2 / 0), <i>Historia Alexandri (ε) – rec. byz. poetica</i> (2+1 / 0), Eusebius of Caesarea (<u>44+4 / 2</u>), Libanius (7 / 0), Julian the Apostate (4 / 0), Basil of Ancyra (0+2 / 0), Themistius (<u>4+15 / 5+2</u>), Athanasius of Alexandria (8 / 0), <u>Basil of Caesarea</u></p>	

Table III (cont.)

(6+1 / 4+2), Ephrem the Syrian (6 / 0), Gregory of Nyssa (1 / 7), Gregory Nazianzen (3+1 / 0+1), Eusebius of Emesa (1 / 0), Severian of Gabala (2 / 0), Oribasius (12+1 / 1), Nemesius of Emesa (0 / 3), Marcellus of Ancyra (4 / 1), Eutropius (1 / 0), Hefaeestion of Thebes (7 / 2), Ammon (1 / 0), Cyril of Jerusalem (2 / 0), Diodorus of Tarsus (0 / 1), Apollinarius of Laodicea (3 / 0), Didymus the Blind (1 / 7), Pappus of Alexandria (1 / 2), Theon of Alexandria (**2 / 188**), Epiphanius of Salamis (**90 / 7**), John Chrysostom (**19+12 / 2**), Eunapius of Sardis (0 / 1+1), Macarius Magnes (3 / 0), Hesychius of Jerusalem (2 / 0), Ps.-Macarius/Symeon (0 / 3+3), John Stobaeus (2+1 / 2), Theodore of Mopsuestia (10 / 0), Polychronius of Apamea (3 / 0), Syrianus (**0 / 15**), Ps.-Martyrius (0+1 / 0), Theodosius of Alexandria (0 / 1+1), Isidore of Pelusium (13 / 0), Concilium Ephesenum (**112+2 / 10**), Cyril of Alexandria (**748[758]+7 / 9**), Socrates Scholasticus (**26+1 / 2+1**), Basil of Seleucia (3 / 0), Theodoret of Cyrrhus (**47 / 2**), Concilium Chalcedonense (6 / 4), Vita Alexandri hegumeni (1 / 0), Vita Donati (0 / 1), Lachares (0 / 1), Hierocles (1 / 3), Diadochus of Photice (12 / 0), Gennadius I (1 / 0), Proclus of Athens (**15+8 / 7+3**), Marinus (3+1 / 0), Ammonius (0 / 3), John of Caesarea (3 / 0), Damascius (0 / 1), Ps.-Dionysius the Areopagite (6 / 0), Aetius of Amida (3 / 0), Sergius's Vita Marciani Oeconomi (0 / 1), Olympiodorus the Deacon (6 / 5+1), Procopius of Gaza (0 / 2), Ps.-Gelasius (0 / 0+1), Ps.-Caesarius (1 / 0), Anthemius of Tralles (1 / 0), Choricus of Gaza (1+1 / 0), Cosmas Indicopleustes (1 / 0), Leontius of Jerusalem (1 / 1), John the Lydian (**19+1 / 3**), John Scholasticus (5 / 6), Vita Marcelli Acoemetae (0 / 1), Evagrius Scholasticus (1+2 / 2), Simplicius (2 / 8), *Justinian I (6 / 0), Olympiodorus of Alexandria (2 / 2), David the Philosopher (0 / 4), John Philoponus (3 / 10), Pamphilus the Theologian (perhaps identical with Pamphilus of Jerusalem, cf. above, 1 / 0), Anastasius I of Antioch (2 / 0), Alexander of Tralles (0 / 1), Eustratius (1 / 0), John Moschus (2 / 0), Ps.-Hermippus (0 / 7), Vita Symeonis Stylitae iun. (0 / 1), Martyrium Cononis (1 / 0), Vita Matronae (1 / 0), Vita Theodori Tironis BHG 1764 (0 / 1), Vita Metrophanis et Alexandri (2 / 1); Passio mulierum 40 et Ammonis (0 / 1)

total: (1321+63 / 366+17) | 1384 s / 383 pl

7th-11th AD

Stephen of Alexandria (4+1 / 1+1), Antioch Pandectes (0 / 1), Paul of Aegina (5 / 2), John I of Thessalonica (3 / 0), Sophronius of Jerusalem (5 / 6), Concilium 649 (3 / 1), Chronicon paschale (3 / 1), Theodore of Raithu (0 / 2+1), Maximus the Confessor (**65 / 2**), Anastasius Apocrisiarius (2 / 0), George the Hieromonk (0 / 1), Theodore of Tremithus (1 / 0), Hesychius of Sinai (1 / 1), Trichas (**0 / 17**), Concilium Constantinopolitanum III (1 / 1+1), Doctrina Patrum (6 / 0), Vitae Alypii Stylitae (0 / 2+1), Vita et encomium Alypii Stylitae₄ BHG 66d (1 / 0), Miracula sancti Demetrii (0 / 3), Miracula sancti Artemii (0 / 1), Passio Gordiani (1 / 0), Miracula Cosmae et Damiani (1 / 0), Vita Theodori Stratelatae (0+1 / 0), Isaac of Nineveh (4 / 1), Gregory of Acragas (0 / 1), Ps.-David / Ps.-Elijah (0 / 1), ?Leontius Mechanicus (0 / 3), Germanus I (0 / 2+2), Andrew of Crete (2+1 / 3), John of Damascus (**15 / 10**), Cosmas of Maiuma (0 / 7), Theophilus of Edessa [De rebus praesertim bellicis] (0 / 1), Leontius of Rome (5 / 0), Stephen the Deacon (1 / 1), Actiones concilii Nicaeni II (5 / 2), Nicephorus I (5 / 1), Novella of Leo and Constantine (0 / 1), George Choeroboscus (0+1 / 1 [in quot.]), Theognostus (0 / 1), Leontius of Damascus (1 / 0+1), Theodore the Studite (1 / 0), Ignatius the Deacon (2 / 0), Michael Syncellus (0 / 1), Leo of Thessalonica (1 / 0), Translatio Theodori Studitae et Iosephi (0 / 1), Methodius of Constantinople (5 / 7+5), Sophronius I of Alexandria (1 / 3), Euodius (1 / 0), Vita Andreae in crisi (0+1 / 0), Vita Maximi Confessoris BHG 1233m (1 / 0), Ps.-John the Monk's Protocanonarium (2 / 0), John of Sardis (3 / 2), Hippiatrica (1 / 2), Acta concilii C-poleos, sessio 879-880 (2 / 1+1), Vita Theophylacti Nicomediensis (1 / 0), Sabbas, Vita Ioannicii (5 / 0), Sabbas, Vita Petri Atroatae (3 / 1), Vita et miracula Petri Atroatae (3 / 1), Theophanes Continuatus (0 / 2), Martyrium Procopii Scythopolitani (1 / 0), Passio sancti

Georgii (Ath. 343, Vat. Pal. 205, et al., vers. plur.) (1 / 0), *Vita Athanasiae Aeginetae* (0 / 1), *Vita Michaelis Syncelli* (0 / 2), Michael the Studite, *Vita Theodori Studitae* (2 / 0), *Vita Eliae spelaiotae* (1 / 0), *Vita Theodorae imperatricis* (0 / 1), *Vita Theocleti* (1 / 0), Metrophanes's? *Vita Euthymii Sardensis* (0 / 1), Gregory's *Vita Basilii Iunioris* (6 / 6), George the Monk (15 / 0), ?Paul of Nicaea (0 / 1), Photius (18+3 / 34+18), Peter of Sicily (1 / 0), John Syncellus / *De sacris imaginibus contra Constantinum Cabalinum* (1 / 0), *Scripta anonyma adversus judaeos* (4 / 13), Nicetas the Teacher (2 / 8+1), Nicetas David Paphlagon (1 / 3), Peter of Argus (1 / 0), *Basilica & Ecloga Basilicarum* + scholia (3 / 5), Leo VI the Wise (3 [Nov. 94 + 2x in hom.] + 8 [Nov. 5, 23, 25, 40, 60, 97 + 2x in hom.] / 3 [Nov. 29, 33, 94] + 3 [Nov. 19, 93, 95]), Leo Choerosphactes (1 / 0), Arethas of Caesarea (0 / 8+2), Nicholas I Mysticus (1+2 / 2+3), Euthymius I of Constantinople (3 / 6), Theodore Daphnopates (1 / 9), John Cameniates (1 / 1), Theodore of Nicaea (1 / 0), Professor Anonymus (0 / 1), Constantine VII (2 / 8 [1 x Nov. 12] +2), Leo's *Vita Theodori Cytherii* (0 / 2), *Vita Pauli iunioris* (0 / 0+3), *Vita Pauli iunioris Caiumae* (0 / 1), *Sylloge tacticorum* (9 / 21+2), Lucas Adialeiptus (3 / 0), Symeon Eulabes or the Studite (0 / 1), *De velitatione bellica* (2 / 9), Symeon Metaphrastes (2+4 / 7+26), Leo the Deacon (2 / 0), Digenis Acritas (2 / 0), *Martyrium Sebastianae* (1 / 0), *Vita Lazari* (1+1 / 0), *Passio anonyma XLII martyrum Amoriensum* (2+1 / 0+2), *Laudatio seu passio Jacobi Zebedaei* (0 / 0+1), John of Sicily (10+1 / 1), Philetus of Tarsus (1 / 0), John Doxopatres (0 / 3 [at least 2 in quot.]), Symeon the New Theologian (3 / 8), Michael Psellus (5 / 3), Nicetas Stethatus (1 / 1), John Scylitzes + *Scyl. Cont.* (0 / 5), Christopher of Mytilene (1 / 1), Michael Cerularius, sp. (0 / 2), Symeon Seth (0 / 2), Michael of Ephesus (0 / 3), John Mauropous (0 / 1), Philip Solitarius (3 / 9), Michael Attaleiates (0 / 1), *Vita Athanasii Athonitae* BHG 198b (0 / 1), Hierotheus the Hieromonk (1 / 1+2), Nikon of Montenegro (1 / 1), ?John Hagioelites (0 / 1), John II of Kyiv (0 / 1), Greek translator of al-Razi/Rhazes (0 / 4), Achaicus the Presbyter's *Vita Nicolai junioris* BHG 2309 (0 / 1+1), *Synoptikon syntagma philosophias* (0 / 2), *Passio Mauri Gallipolitani, cod. Messan.* 29 (0 / 1)

total: (293+25 / 306+79) | 318 s / 385 pl

12th–16th AD

Symeon II of Jerusalem (0 / 2), Nicholas III the Grammarian (1+1 / 0), Theodore of Smyrna (0 / 3), Euthymius Zigabenus (23+1 / 7+1), Isaac Comnenus (1 / 1), Eustratius of Nicaea (0 / 2), Teophylact of Ohrid (15 / 6), Anna Comnena (4 / 3+1), Nicephorus Bryennius (1 / 0), Theodore Prodromus (5 / 11), Nicetas Seides (4 / 1), Michael Didascalus (1 / 0), Peter the Deacon (1 / 0), John Cedrenus (8 / 3 – mostly rewritten from his sources), Michael Glycas (0 / 22), Nicetas of Maronea (0 / 4), Theorianus (3 / 0), Philagathus Cerameus (3 / 0), *Timarion* (1 / 0), Anacharsis/Ananias (0 / 1), Gregory Pardus (1 / 1), John Zonaras (0 / 1), Nicetas Eugenianus (1 / 0), Nicholas of Methone (1 / 2), Nicholas III of Anchialus (1 / 0), John Tzetzes (84+5 / 29+9), Isaac Tzetzes (5 / 0), Andronicus Camaterus (1 / 2+1), John Cinnamus (0+7 / 1), Eustathius of Thessalonica (0 / 14), Theodora Raulaina (3 / 0), Euthymius Malaces (1 / 0), Neophytus the Recluse (2+1 / 14+1), Nicephorus Chrysoberges (2+2 / 2), Nicholas of Otranto (3 / 9), Michael Choniates (5 / 2), Nicetas Choniates (6 / 2), Theodosius Gudeles (1 / 1), Neilus of Thamasia (0 / 1), Nicephorus Blemmydes (2 / 5+2), Demetrius Chomatenus (0 / 1), Germanus II (0 / 1), Manuel Gabalas (1+1 / 0), Acacius Sabaites (0 / 1), *Vita Naumi Ohridense* (0 / 1), *Vita Bartholomei Simeritae* (0 / 2), *Vita Christoduli* (1 / 0), *Miracula Christoduli* BHG 305&306 (0 / 4), *Vita Joannis Acatii* (1 / 0), Andrew Libadenus (0+1 / 0), Theodore II Ducas Lascaris (2 / 4), Theodore Scutariotes (0 / 1), Theognostus the Hieromonk (1 / 1), Joel the Chronographer (0 / 1), George Acropolites (11 / 9+1), Constantine Meliteniotes (5 / 1), Maximus Planudes (13 / 21+3), George Metochites

Table III (cont.)

(1 / 5), Demetrius Triclinius (0 / 2), Meletius Galesiotes (2 / 1+1), John XI Beccus (5+1 / 8), Gregory II of Cyprus (1 / 1+1), George Moschamper (2 / 8), Athanasius I of Constantinople (**16/0**), George Pachymeres (0 / 4), Mercurius the Grammarian (4 / 1), John Pediasimus (1 / 5), Manuel Bryennius (0 / 3), Manuel Moschopolus (1 / 0), Theodore Metochites (90 / 15), John XIII Glycas (2+20 / 19+10), Constantine Acropolites (10 / 2), Nicephorus Chumnu (2 / 11), Irena Chumnaena (1 / 0), John the Actuarius (1 / 0), Andronicus II (4 ^[Nov. 20 i 32] / 0), Joseph Rhacendytes (0 / 4), Constantine Lucites (0 / 0+1), Matthew Blastares (0 / 1), Nicephorus Callistus Xanthopolus (5+1 / 6+3), Gregory Sinaites (1 / 0), Ephrem of Aenus (**34/2**), Isaac Argyrus (1 / 0), Theoctistus the Studite (2 / 6), Theodore Dexius (**1/15+3**), Gregory Palamas (8 / 6+1), Gregory Acindynus (16 / 1), David Dishypatus (3 / 1), Schol. coll. Marc. in Dionysii Thracis (0 / 1), Joseph Calothetus (3+1 / 1), Michael Gabras (**13 / 0**), Thomas Magister (13+2 / 7), Anthony of Larissa (5 / 4), Nicephorus Gregoras (8 / 25), Registrum Patr. Const. (0 / 5), John VI Cantacuzenus (**3+6 / 7+19**), Constantine Harmenopolus (1 / 1), Nicholas Artabasdu Rhabdas (0 / 2), Macarius Chrysocephalus (0 / 0+1), Neilus Cabasilas (1 / 1), Demetrius Cydones (2 / 3+1), Prochorus Cydones (1 / 0), Callistus I (4 / 7+1), Theophanes Parorites (2 / 2), Philotheus Coccinus (36+1 / 6+2), John Cyparissiotis (+sp.) (3+1 / 5+1), Isidore Glabas (4 / 22+1), Theodore Meliteniotes (0 / 26+3), Nicetas Myrsiniotes (1 / 1), George of Pelagonia (1 / 1), Theophanes III of Nicaea (5 / 0), Matthew Asanes Cantacuzenus (1 / 0), Callistus Angelicudes (2 / 3+1), Vita Romyli/Romuli (1 / 4), editor of Pachymeres (0 / 20+1), Manuel Chrysoloras (1 / 1), Symeon of Thessalonica (0 / 7), Nicholas Cabasilas (1 / 0), Joseph Bryennius (6+1 / 1), Tractatus arithmeticus, e cod. Vat. Barb. gr. 4 (0 / 2), Vita Athanasii Meteoritae (2 / 3), Vita Oppiani Anazarbensis (0 / 1), De planetae (0 / 5), Manuel Calecas (9+1 / 5), Manuel II (2+1 / 2 ^[Nov. 60]), John Anagnostes (1 / 1), John Eugenicus (4 / 0), Gabriel the Hieromonk (0 / 2), Joasaph of Ephesus (0+1 / 1), John Doceianus (1 / 0), John Chortasmenus (0+2 / 0), Concilium Florentinum (0 / 7), Isidore of Kyiv (0+1 / 0), Mark Eugenicus (0 / 2), Constantine XI (0 / 2), Thomas Palaeologus (0 / 2), Andrew Chrysoberges (0 / 1), John Canabutzes (0 / 1), Silvester Syropulus (1+1 / 1), George Gemistus Plethon (0+1 / 3), Laonicus Chalcocondyles (1 / 0), Gregory III Mammas (2 / 0), Gennadius II Scholarius (3+1 / 1+2), Theodore Agallianus (2 / 1), Michael Critobulus (2 / 0), Bessarion (2 / 3), George of Trebizond (0+1 / 2), Theodore Gazes (2 / 1), John Argyropulus (2 / 1), Michael Apostolius (5+1 / 1), Chronicon Ioanninae (0 / 1), Ducas (0 / 2), Ps.-Sphrantzes (0 / 3), Demetrius Moschus (1 / 0), Meletius Pigas (1 / 5), Vitae Gregorii ep. Assi (0 / 2), Vita Nectarii et Theophanis (0 / 1), Testamenta Nectarii et Theophanis (1 / 0), Opusculum de origine schismatis [Italiae] (0 / 2), Metrophanes Critopulus (2 / 0), Jerome Tragudistes (0 / 1), Pachomius Rhusanus (4 / 11)

total: (607+64 / 569+72) | 671 s / 641 pl

Documents of Athonite monasteries (**9+2 / 25**), typica (8 / 10), euchologia of Goar (0 / 3), Vita Joanni Chrysostomi (1 / 0), scholia to Aristophanes (**11 / 8**), scholia to Lycophron (**21+1 / 9**), menologia (**0 / 0+10**)

total: (50+3 / 55+10) | 53 s / 65 pl

total above: (2946+254 / 1531+193) | 3200 s / 1724 pl

Valid for 30 October 2022, with 2857 authors included TLG.

Table IV. Tables II and III, juxtaposed [SCer 5, 2015, p. 186–188]

* some numbers in columns 2 and 4 should be treated as approximate	1. ὡς προέφην and similar	2. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφην + ὥσπερ ἔφην	3. ὡς προέφημεν and similar	4. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφη(α)μεν + ὥσπερ ἔφη(α)μεν
Philodemus of Gadara	–	3	1	1
Arius Didymus	1	–	–	–
Ps.-Aristotle	–	–	1	1
Dionysius of Halicarnassus	–	2 + 45	–	2
Strabo	–	8 + 1	–	3 + 3
Philo of Alexandria	–	44 + 4	–	–
Nicomachus	–	1	2	1
Flavius Joseph	–	13 + 2	–	7
Justin the Martyr	17	2	16	1
Claudius Ptolemy	–	3	–	60
Apollonius Dyscolus	–	3	–	36
Galen	1	ca. 370 + 10	–	15
Irenaeus of Lyons	–	–	6 or 7	1
Alexander of Aphrodisias	–	12	–	23
<i>Clementina</i>	1	25	–	2
<i>Hist. Alexandri (ε)</i>	2	2 + 1	1	–
Eusebius of Caesarea	–	44 + 4	–	2
Themistius	–	4 + 15	–	5 + 2
Basil of Caesarea	1	6 + 1	–	4 + 2
Ps.-Ephrem of Chersonesus	–	–	3	–
Gregory of Nyssa	2	1	3	7
Evagrius Ponticus	–	–	1	–
Ps.-Athanasius	–	–	1	–
Theon of Alexandria	–	2	–	188
Epiphanius of Salamis	–	90	2 (in quot.)	7

Table IV (cont.)

* some numbers in columns 2 and 4 should be treated as approximate	1. ὡς προέφην and similar	2. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφην + ὡσπερ ἔφην	3. ὡς προέφημεν and similar	4. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφη(α)μεν + ὡσπερ ἔφη(α)μεν
John Chrysostom	2	19 + 12	–	2
Ps.-Macarius	–	–	5	3 + 3
John Stobaeus	1	2 + 1	1	2
Polychronius of Apamea	1	3	–	–
Syrianus	–	–	–	15
Palladius	1	–	–	–
Philostorgius	1	–	1	–
Cyril of Alexandria	–	748[758] + 7	–	9
Socrates Scholasticus	–	26 + 1	–	2 + 1
Theodoret of Cyrrihus	–	47	1 (in quot.)	2
Eutyches	1	–	–	–
<i>Vita Alexandri hegumeni</i>	–	1	1	–
Diadochus of Photice	1	12	–	–
Gennadius I	1	1	1	–
Proclus of Athens	1	15 + 8	1	7 + 3
anon. papyr. mag.	1	–	–	–
Ps.-Gelasius	1	–	–	0 + 1
Ps.-Caesarius	4	1	–	–
John the Lydian	–	19 + 1	4	3
John Scholasticus	1	5	5	6
<i>Vita Irenae</i>	1	–	–	–
<i>Martyrium Dionysii Areopagitae</i>	–	–	1	–
Abraham of Ephesus	–	–	1	–
Fl. Phoebammon	1	–	–	–
<i>Chronicon paschale</i>	1	3	–	1
John Climacus	–	–	1	–
Maximus the Confessor	4	65	–	2

* some numbers in columns 2 and 4 should be treated as approximate	1. ὡς προέφηγ and similar	2. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφηγ + ὡσπερ ἔφηγ	3. ὡς προέφημεν and similar	4. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφη(α)μεν + ὡσπερ ἔφη(α)μεν
George Presbyter (Hieromonk)	–	–	1	1
Trichas	–	–	–	17
<i>Vita Alypii Stylitae</i> ₁	–	–	1	2 + 1
<i>Vita Eustathii, Thespesii, Anatolii</i>	1	–	–	–
Pamphilus of Jerusalem	(1?)	(1?)	1	–
Isaac of Nineveh	1	4	–	1
John of Damascus	1 (in quot.)	15	1 (in quot.)	10
Leontius of Rome	–	5	2	–
Tarasius I	1	–	–	–
Acts of Nicaea II	–	5	1	2
novella of Irene	–	–	1	–
George Syncellus	–	–	–	–
Theophanes the Confessor	6	–	5	–
Novella of Leo & Constantine	–	–	3	1
George Choeroboscus	–	0 + 1	1	1 (in quot.)
Michael Syncellus	–	–	2	1
Ps.-John of Damascus	–	–	1	–
<i>Vita Constantini et Helenae</i>	–	–	1	–
<i>Vita Nicephori Medicii</i>	–	–	1	–
Methodius I	–	5	1	7 + 5
Sophronius of Alexandria	–	1	1	3
<i>Vita Andreae in crisi</i>	1	0 + 1	–	–
Sabbas (<i>Vita Ioannicii</i>)	1	5	–	–
Sabbas (<i>Vita Petri Atratoatae</i>)	1	3	–	1
<i>Vita Athanasiae Aeginetae</i>	–	–	1	1

Table IV (cont.)

* some numbers in columns 2 and 4 should be treated as approximate	1. ὡς προέφην and similar	2. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφην + ὡσπερ ἔφην	3. ὡς προέφημεν and similar	4. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφην(α)μεν + ὡσπερ ἔφην(α)μεν
George the Monk	–	15	1	–
?Paul of Nicaea	1	–	–	1
Photius I	–	18 + 3	3	34 + 18
<i>Acta concilii C-poleos 879–880</i>	–	2	1	1
– quot. of Procopius	–	–	1	–
Nicetas the Teacher	–	2	1	8 + 1
Leo VI the Wise	1	3 + 8	–	3 + 3
Arethas of Caesarea	–	–	1	8 + 2
Nicholas Mysticus	1	1 + 2	4	2 + 3
Basil	–	–	1	–
Constantine VII	–	2	2	8 + 2
<i>Martyrium Irenaei</i>	1	–	–	–
<i>Vita Pauli iun.</i>	–	–	1	0 + 3
<i>Sylloge tacticorum</i>	–	9	–	21 + 2
Lucas Adialeiptus	1	3	–	–
Ps.-Heron	–	–	1	–
Nicephorus (<i>Vita s. Andreae</i>)	2	–	–	–
<i>De velitatione bellica</i>	–	2	1	9
Symeon Metaphrastes	–	2 + 4	–	7 + 26
<i>Digenis Acritas</i>	1	2	–	–
John of Sicily	2	10 + 1	–	1
acts of monastery in Oppido	2	–	–	–
Michael Cerularius	–	–	1	2
acts of monastery in Cellarana	–	–	2	–
Philip Solitarius	3	3	5	9

* some numbers in columns 2 and 4 should be treated as approximate	1. ὡς προέφην and similar	2. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφην + ὡσπερ ἔφην	3. ὡς προέφημεν and similar	4. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφη(α)μεν + ὡσπερ ἔφη(α)μεν
Michael Attaleiates	–	–	3	1
<i>Vita Cosmae et Joannis</i>	–	–	1?	–
<i>Vita Niconis</i>	–	–	2	–
Christodulus	–	–	4	–
<i>Vita Phantini iun.</i>	1	–	–	–
<i>Translatio Nicolai</i>	–	–	1	–
Theodore of Andida	–	–	1	–
Euthymius Zigabenus	–	23 + 1	11 (+ 1 in quot.)	7 + 1
Teophylact of Ohrid	–	15	–	6
Theodore Prodromus	–	5	–	11
Michael Glycas	–	–	–	22
John Tzetzes	4	84 + 5	4	29 + 9
Eustathius of Thessalonica	–	–	2	14
akts of mon. of Theristes	2	–	4	–
Neophytus the Recluse	7	2 + 1	13	14 + 1
Nicholas of Otranto	3	3	10	9
Acacius Sabaites	–	–	1	1
Manuel Holobolus	1	–	–	–
Andrew Libadenus	1	0 + 1	–	–
George Acropolites	1	11	1	9 + 1
Constantine Meliteniotes	2	5	–	1
Maximus Planudes	–	13	1	21 + 3
<i>Apparitio Michaelis</i>	–	–	1	–
Athanasius I of C-ple	–	16	–	–
George Metochites	1	1	2	5
Theodore Metochites	–	90	1	15
John XIII Glycas	1	2 + 20	1	19 + 10

Table IV (cont.)

* some numbers in columns 2 and 4 should be treated as approximate	1. ὡς προέφην and similar	2. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφην + ὡσπερ ἔφην	3. ὡς προέφημεν and similar	4. ὡς/καθὼς ἔφη(α)μεν + ὡσπερ ἔφη(α)μεν
Ephrem of Aenus	–	34	–	2
Theodore Dexius	–	1	–	15 + 3
Gregory Palamas	1	8	1	6 + 1
Gregory Acindynus	–	16	1	1
David Dishypatus	–	3	3	1
<i>Schol. coll. Marciana</i>	–	–	2	1
Michael Gabras	–	13	–	–
Thomas Magister	–	13 + 2	2	7
Nicephorus Gregoras	1	8	1	25
John VI Cantacuzenus	–	3 + 6	–	7 + 19
Theophanes Parorites	–	2	1	2
Philotheus Coccinus	1	36 + 1	–	6 + 2
John Cyparissiotis, (+sp.)	–	3 + 1	1	5 + 1
Isidore Glabas	–	4	1	22 + 1
Theodore Meliteniotes	–	–	6	26 + 3
Callistus Angelicudes	–	2	2	3 + 1
<i>Vita Romyli / Romuli</i>	–	1	1	4
editor of Pachymeres	–	–	1	20 + 1
Symeon of Thessalonica	2	–	2	7
<i>Tractatus arithmeticus</i>	–	–	1	2
Manuel II	1	2 + 1	–	2
John Cananus	–	–	1	–
Gennadius II Scholarius	–	3 + 1	1	1 + 2
Ducas	–	–	2	2
<i>Ekthesis chronica</i>	–	–	1	–
Sphrantzes/Melissenus	1	–	2	3

A few anonymous or multi-author works were omitted (e.g. *Prochiron*). Only the most representative or outstanding examples of authors present in the table III but absent from the table II supplement the table IV.

The updated statistics:

- » [p. 177] forms of πρόφημι attested in ca. 135 authors; 321 cases altogether (105 s, 216 pl, with 75 new examples added after 2015), with 2857 (previously 2420) authors, and ca. 11 000 works consulted;
- » [p. 178] 11 x ὡς προέφην / προέφημεν makes almost 3,5% of all instances in the whole preserved corpus;
- » [p. 180] ὡς ἔφην – 3082 occurrences, ὡς ἔφημεν/-αμεν – 1660 (ἔφαμεν x 882 / ἔφημεν x 778), καθὼς ἔφην (only 44), καθὼς ἔφημεν/-αμεν – 54 (ἔφημεν x 30 / ἔφαμεν x 24), ὡσπερ ἔφην – 278, ὡσπερ ἔφημεν/-αμεν – 201 (ἔφημεν x 151 / ἔφαμεν x 50). In total in TLG – 5319, with 188 s and 191 pl omitted in the table (catenae, centons, anonymous scholia, passages of euchologia, identified cross-checked quotations and scraps of spurious authorship, as well as the works from the 17th c. and later);
- » [p. 189] καθὼς ἔφην/ἔφημεν/-αμεν – 98 in total, cf. 26 καθὼς προέφην/προέφημεν/-αμεν;
- » [p. 189] a total of 4924 occurrences with the second aorist of φημί is almost 15,5 times as many as the alternative expressions with the second aorist of πρόφημι (total 321);
- » [p. 190] more than 80 cases of authors in the Table IV who used both singular and plural forms;
- » [p. 191] ὡς εἶρηται – 9094, ὡς προεῖρηται – 1752 in TLG (as for 30 September 2022).

Commentary

The comprehensive re-count and reconsideration of the phrases, conducted after seven years and based on a significantly extended sample of Greek texts, have confirmed the conclusions I presented in 2015.

1. Cross-references within narratives are valuable indicators of style and authorship. They were applied to a wide variety of genres: chronicles and histories, scholarly treatises, sermons, hagiographic and other ecclesiastical texts, refutations, panegyrics and commentaries, legal texts and acts of law, scholia etc. They were used both in speech and naturally, even more so, in writing. Their usefulness lies in their variety and diversity of usage, cf. ὡς/καθὼς[/ὡσπερ]: εἶρηται, προεῖρηται, ἔφην, ἔφημεν/-αμεν, προέφην, προέφημεν/-αμεν, λέλεκται, προλέλεκται, δεδήλωται, προδεδήλωται, δεδηλώκαμεν, δηλωθήσεται, ἀποδέδεικται, προαπεδείξαμεν, etc., as well as e.g. ὁ δὲ ἀνωτέρω μνημονευθεὶς, οὗ πρόσθεν ἐμνήσθην, οὗ πρόσθεν ἐμνημονεύσαμεν and many others. The inclusion of particles and parentheses into such phrases was common as well (with γὰρ, ἦδη, καὶ, ἀνωτέρω, ἐκεῖ, πρὸ βραχέος, ἐν τοῖς ἐξῆς, ἐξῆς, ἐφεξῆς etc. or e.g. ἐκ τῶν αὐτοῦ συγγραμμάτων) and also varied. Therefore, all the forms within one text should be compared altogether and not only individually. One may add that some of them were much more common and thus less distinctive, while some others were very specific. At the same time, the frequency and particular choice of the respective phrases reveal the individuality, or even peculiarity, of the authors' styles.

2. Ὡς/καθὼς προέφην or προέφημεν, never used by George Syncellus but applied eleven times by Theophanes, both in the prooimion and in various parts of his chronicle, remain a specific trait of the author's style. Unlike ὡς ἔφην, ἔφημεν/-αμεν, these phrases were always rare in ancient and medieval Greek, and it

is only in texts by a total of four writers that one may find them used more frequently. Those were Justin the Martyr (33 x, 17 s + 16 pl), Euthymius Zigabenus (12 pl), Neophytus the Recluse (20 x, 7 s + 13 pl), and Nicholas of Otranto (13 x, 3 s + 10 pl). The first one lived centuries before Theophanes, the three latter ones long after his *Chronography* had been written. The next ones in frequency cannot match the above-mentioned literati, even if their texts were much more independent from their sources than in the case of the 'copy-paste' historian: cf. Philip Solitarius (3 s, 5 pl – added now, with the quite individualised and complex way in which he formulated such expressions⁴), John Tzetzes (4 s, 4 pl), Irenaeus (7 pl), John Scholasticus (1 s, 5 pl), and Theodore Meliteniotes (6 pl). Still, it is only in the *Chronography* that we encounter all these forms: ὡς προέφην, καθὼς καὶ προέφην, ὡς προέφημεν, καθὼς προέφημεν (note that, as we see in Table IV, many authors wrote both in the singular and in the plural, so that the factor is not at odds with singular authorship).

3. Neither George Syncellus nor Theophanes used ὡς ἔφην or ὡς ἔφημεν/-αμεν, the phrases that were much more universal and either used interchangeably with ὡς προέφην and ὡς προέφημεν or exclusively (Table IV, again). With 321 examples of the latter ones, and more than five thousand of the former, the 11 instances of πρόφημι-expressions in the *Chronography* become yet more telling (even the more so as forms built with καθὼς were always a double rarity).

4. Thus, having once again verified the previous research, I would like to repeat that I have not changed my mind as regards the following: 1°. I believe that the *Ekloge Chronographias* of George Syncellus and the *Chronography* of Theophanes the Confessor should be treated as a single project (here I agree, as I did in the past, with Jesse W. Torgerson), undertaken in turn by two authors; 2°. There are important stylistic differences between the two parts, noticeable in the fragments in which the authors deliver some editorial remarks, disclose their personal opinions or refer to the other parts of their own narrative; 3°. The style of the proemium of the *Chronography* fits the rest of the work and differs from the work of George. 4°. The precise analysis of a wider group of similar clauses shows that the *Ekloge Chronographias* and the *Chronography* were written by two different authors; the *Chronography* was created by one author, distinctive and independent, reproductive though he was. I see no convincing arguments not to call this author Theophanes, given the middle Byzantine tradition that started not long after his *floruit*. Some later and partial editorial interventions to the *Chronography*, conceivable and in some instances even certain, do not challenge that view. 5°. Only a few

⁴ Sing.: ὡς προέφην; ὡς ἤδη σοι προέφην (x2); plur.: καθὼς σοι καὶ προέφημεν ἄνωθεν ἐν τῷ λόγῳ; καθὰ δὴ καὶ προέφημεν πρὸ μικροῦ ἐν τῷ λόγῳ; καθὼς πέρ σοι προέφημεν ἐν τῷ δευτέρῳ λόγῳ; καθὼςπερ καὶ προέφημεν πολλάκις ἐν τῷ λόγῳ; ὡς προέφημεν πολλάκις ἐν τῷ λόγῳ (cf. Table II).

entries from the initial parts of the *Chronography* fit George's work more closely; their style and content bear much more similarities with the *Ekloge* (in AM 5796, 5814, 5818, 5827, 5828). These paragraphs might have been inserted to the *Chronography* by its author in the same way in which he used his sources for the subsequent parts; they did not reach beyond the times of Constantine the Great. The disquisitions and polemics inserted into the entries covering the reign of Nicephorus I do not resemble the style of George Syncellus more than that of Theophanes, and they lack the phrases so typical of George's part of the universal history. 6°. There is no need to dismiss the message of the proemium to the *Chronography*, especially as regards the 'genuine friendship' of the writers.

5. Of all the additions to the tables, I would like to draw the Readers' attention to οἶων προέφημεν in the novel 27 of the Empress Irene, to ὡς καὶ προέφηγ of the patriarch Tarasius and to ἰδὸν καθὼς προέφημεν noted in the acts of the Seventh Ecumenical Council (see Table II). One of the public activities of Theophanes of Sigriane, as known from the *vitae* and encomia devoted to him, was his presence at the council. The clauses discussed here must have seemed regular to that ecclesiastical, Tarasian milieu which Theophanes belonged to, befriended or acquainted and which benefitted from the restoration of the icons, as they were given liberty to exercise their faith and educate from one another safely⁵. Later, these phrases resonate in the written words of Theophanes, but not in those of patriarch Nicephorus, Theodore the Studite or George Syncellus, whose extensive outputs remained preserved to our times.

Bibliography

- ALBRECHT S., *Theophanes Confessor*, [in:] *Encyclopedia of Medieval Chronicle*, vol. II, J–Z, ed. G. DUNPHY, Leiden–Boston 2010, p. 1421–1422.
- BRODKA D., *Rebellen und Usurpatoren – zur Benutzung der Theodor-Lector-Epitome durch Theophanes*, [in:] *Studies in Theodore Anagnostes*, ed. R. KOSIŃSKI, A. SZOPA, Turnhout 2021, p. 183–203, <https://doi.org/10.1484/M.STTA-EB.5.127981>
- KOMPA A., *Gnesioi filoi: the Search for George Syncellus' and Theophanes the Confessor's Own Words, and the Authorship of their Oeuvre*, "Studia Ceranea" 5, 2015, p. 155–230, <https://doi.org/10.18778/2084-140X.05.06>
- KOMPA A., *In Search of Syncellus' and Theophanes' Own Words, and the Authorship of the Chronographia Revisited*, "Travaux et mémoires" 19, 2015 (= *Studies in Theophanes*, ed. M. JANKOWIAK, F. MONTINARO, Paris 2015), p. 73–92.
- MARINOW K., *Pan Kubrat i jego pięciu synów. Teofanesa wizja przybycia Bułgarów na Półwysep Bałkański*, "Balcanica Posnaniensia" 23, 2016, p. 15–34, <https://doi.org/10.14746/bp.2016.23.2>

⁵ Cf. O. PRIETO DOMÍNGUEZ, *Literary circles*, p. 57–59, 83–84.

- MONTINARO F., *Histories of Byzantium: Some Remarks on the Early Manuscripts of Theophanes' Chronicle*, "Semitica et Classica" 8, 2015, p. 171–176, <https://doi.org/10.1484/J.SEM.5.109193>
- NEVILLE L., *Guide to Byzantine Historical Writing*, Cambridge 2018, <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781139626880>
- PARRINELLO R.M., *Teofane il Confessore, ovvero la storia letta da un punto di vista cristiano*, "Rivista di Storia del Cristianesimo" 12, 2015, p. 83–95.
- PRIETO DOMÍNGUEZ O., *Literary Circles in Byzantine Iconoclasm. Patron, Politics and Saints*, Cambridge 2021, <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108868129>
- SIROTENKO A., *Constructing Memory: the Chronicle of Theophanes on the Reign of Heraclius*, [in:] *Storytelling in Byzantium. Narratological Approaches to Byzantine Texts and Images*, ed. C. MESSES, M. MULLETT, I. NILSSON, Uppsala 2018, p. 223–242.
- TORGERSON J.W., *The Chronographia of George the Syncellus and Theophanes. The Ends of Time in Ninth-century Constantinople*, Leiden–Boston 2022 [= Brill's Series on the Early Middle Ages, 28].
- TORGERSON J.W., HUMPHREYS M., *Chronicles, Histories and Letters*, [in:] *A Companion to Byzantine Iconoclasm*, ed. M. HUMPHREYS, Leiden–Boston 2021 [= Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition, 99], p. 191–229, https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004462007_005
- TREADGOLD W., *The Middle Byzantine Historians*, New York 2013, <https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137280862>
- VARONA P., *Three Clergymen against Nikephoros I: Remarks on Theophanes' Chronicle (AM 6295–6303)*, "Byzantion" 84, 2014, p. 485–509.
- YANNOPOULOS P.A., *Un fantôme historique: l'autre Theophane*, "Byzantinische Zeitschrift" 113, 2020, p. 189–217, <https://doi.org/10.1515/bz-2020-0009>

Andrzej Kompa

University of Lodz
Faculty of Philosophy and History
Institute of History
Department of Byzantine Studies
ul. A. Kamińskiego 27a
90-219 Łódź, Polska/Poland
andrzej.kompa@uni.lodz.pl

